



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

Monday, October 24, 2005 - 7:00 P.M.

Plummer Park, Rooms 5 & 6

7377 Santa Monica Blvd, West Hollywood, California

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Hahn called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:07 P.M.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Azar, Castro, Hahn, Joyce, Felchlin Yeber.

Commissioners Absent: None.

Staff Present: Terry Blount – Associate Planner & Staff Liaison
John Chase – Urban Designer
Justine Hearn – Assistant Planner
Tess Nguyen – Contract Senior Planner
Brendan Rome – Commission Secretary

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

ACTION: Approve the Agenda of Monday, October 24, 2005 as presented.
Motion by Commissioner Felchlin, seconded by Commissioner Joyce and unanimously carried.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the minutes of prior Historic Preservation Commission meetings.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve the Minutes of:

A. September 26, 2005

ACTION: Approve the Historic Preservation Commission Minutes of Monday, September 26, 2005 as presented. **Motion by Commissioner Castro, seconded by Commissioner Azar and unanimously carried. (Commissioner Yeber recused himself due to his absence at the September 26, 2005 meeting.)**

5. PUBLIC COMMENT:

WILLIAM NEISH, NO RESIDENCE AT THIS TIME, FORMER WEST HOLLYWOOD RESIDENT requested the Historic Preservation Commission take action to obtain a new audio recording system and a timer at the podium. He stated the Historic Preservation Commission's prior recommendations to City Council regarding Carlton Manor were amended by the developer's request to take on a broader scope. He invited the Historic Preservation Commissioners to feel free to relay any confidential information to him via his website (www.savecarltonmanor.com) and ensured their privacy will be retained if requested.

6. **CONSENT CALENDAR:** None.
7. **COMMISSION CONSIDERATION:** None.
8. **PUBLIC HEARINGS:**

A. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA-005-013):

Justine Hearn, Assistant Planner presented the staff report. She detailed the history and background of the property and project. She stated the request is to add 438 square feet of living space, complete minor interior modifications, replace windows and remove two doors, install a new asphalt shingle roof, repaint the exterior and add landscaping to the Local Cultural Resource located at 1013 Hancock Ave, West Hollywood, California. It was built in 1924 and designated as part of the Craftsman Thematic District in 1993.

Commissioner Yeber requested clarification on the siding and roofing and the differentiation of the new materials.

Commissioner Felchlin requested clarification on the intended removal of the two north side doors and the clapboards to fill the gap.

Chair Hahn opened public testimony for Item 8.A.

There were no public speakers.

ACTION: Close public testimony for Item 8.A. **Motion carried without objection.**

Chair Hahn opened the floor for Commissioner comments and questions.

Commissioner Castro requested clarification on the transition of the old materials and the new materials. Staff deferred the question to the applicant's architect, JENNIFER CHARLESTON, MANHATTAN BEACH. She stated the new materials are still under discussion.

Commissioner Azar requested clarification of the water heater location and the location of any mechanicals. Staff deferred the question to the applicant's architect who stated the water heater will be relocated inside the residence and there will be no mechanical units on the roof.

ACTION: Close the public testimony for Item 8.A. **Motion carried without objection.**

Commissioner Yeber disclosed for the record, he visited the site and (by chance) met with the owner and discussed the proposal.

Discussion was held regarding the existing and intended materials for the roof and the siding.

ACTION: 1) Approve the application; 2) adopt Resolution No. HPC 05-62: "A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD CONDITIONALLY APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA) 2005-013 TO ADD 438 SQUARE FEET OF LIVING SPACE AT THE REAR OF A SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE, COMPLETE MINOR INTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, REPLACE WINDOWS AND REMOVE TWO DOORS, INSTALL A NEW ASPHALT SHINGLE ROOF, REPAINT THE EXTERIOR, AND ADD LANDSCAPING AT A LOCAL CULTURAL RESOURCE LOCATED AT 1013 HANCOCK AVENUE, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA"; 3) Conditions: The areas on the two doors to be filled in are clearly overlapped and cleanly filled in to produce a seamless finished look and the division of the old and new clapboard siding and shingle siding is delineated with a form of trim; 4) Close the public hearing. **Motion by Commissioner Felchlin, seconded by Commissioner Yeber and unanimously carried.**

B. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA-005-008):

Tess Nguyen, Contract Senior Planner presented the staff report. She detailed the history and background of the property and project. She stated the site was designated as a Local Cultural Resource in May 2005 for its courtyard typology with character defining features. She stated that since there are potential impacts on the Local Cultural Resource, a Historical Resource Impact Analysis Report was performed by Jones & Stokes.

Consultant Richard Starzak of Jones & Stokes provided the firms findings regarding the impact analysis and provided recommendations.

Discussion was held regarding Jones & Stokes findings in regards to the compatibility of the materials and scale.

POINT OF INFORMATION: Secretary Rome stated some audience members requested a moment to review the model provided by the applicant and recommended a recess for review.

ACTION: Chair Hahn recessed the meeting at 7:35 PM without objection to allow the public and the Commissioners time to review the model provided by the applicant. The Commission reconvened at 7:43 PM.

Chair Hahn opened the public testimony for Item 8.B.

POINT OF INFORMATION: Secretary Rome stated the applicant has requested a presentation time of 10 minutes instead of the usual 5 minutes. Secretary Rome advised Chair Hahn that the by-laws state the Chair can accommodate this request by the power vested as Chair.

Chair Hahn awarded the applicant their requested 10 minutes of testimony.

FRED SHAFFER, MANHATTAN BEACH introduced the applicant team and provided a quick synopsis of how they are affiliated and which parts of the presentation each team member will provide. He gave history of the designation and stated their willingness to provide a compromise with proposed construction and preserving the Cultural Resource. He provided statement of restoration intentions.

RIC ABRAMSON, WEST HOLLYWOOD thanked the City Staff for their assistance with the process of the project. He presented a “dual court” solution. He discussed setbacks, proposed materials, stairs, stoops and water features.

ROY OLDENKAMP, WEST HOLLYWOOD stated his concerns on the footprint and scale of the proposed new building.

WILLIAM NEISH, “TRANSIENT” gave history of the property’s designation. He asked for clarity on the relationship of the new with the old and how it affects the designation.

DAN KUNZ, WEST HOLLYWOOD stated the intention of the Cultural Resource applicants was to preserve the space and the environment and stated his support for the project.

JESSE SLANSKY was part of the development team and did not speak.

ALLEGRA ALLISON, “TRANSIENT” stated the State Office designated the property because it is an early example and one of the few courtyard housing in Los Angeles. She stated her opposition to the project. She stated her support for historic preservation.

GEORGE CREDLE, WEST HOLLYWOOD, former Historic Preservation Commissioner stated his reasons for voting for the designation. He stated his concerns with the footprint of the structure, the scale of the proposed new building and how this new building may affect the integrity of the historic site.

MARK LEHMAN with GTO, WEST HOLLYWOOD applicant representative stated the property was designated because of the courtyard and the façade of the existing building.

ACTION: Close the public testimony for Item 8.B. **Motion carried without objection.**

Chair Hahn asked for clarification on the EIR process.

Tess Nguyen, Contract Senior Planner stated the initial study did not warrant an EIR and there was no impact with this project that could not be mitigated with landscaping.

Chair Hahn asked for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Yeber asked if there will be any demolition of the designated resource.

Consultant Richard Starzak of Jones & Stokes reminded the Commission that the garage was not part of the designation and it would be demolished. The rear two-thirds to three-quarters of the rear building will be demolished leaving the façade intact. He reminded the Commission the resolution stated the (garage) itself was not designated as architecturally significant.

Commissioner Yeber asked for clarification of the differences between the Local designation and the State's designation.

Staff Liaison Terry Blount stated the National Register does not include character defining features. Staff has still not been notified of the Keeper's determination but it has been found eligible.

Commissioner Felchlin asked for clarification on the parapet, the materials of the new building and the trellis.

RIC ABRAMSON, WEST HOLLYWOOD applicant stated the parapet will be thickened and turn it into an exterior deck with stucco and glass railing. He stated the materials would be a combination of plaster and wood. The third story would be clad in wood to provide clear demarcation of old and new. The south side is wood and plaster siding with intent to break down the scale of the four stories. He stated he was open to the Commission's advisement and he was unclear as to the value of the trellis, he preferred to remove the trellis and achieve the screening with a canopy type tree planted on the ground level.

Commissioner Felchlin commended the applicant on the attempt to respect the Cultural Resource and making the new building compatible. He stated concerns of the scale, size and relationship of the new building. He stated the volume of the new building would alter the character of the Cultural Resource. He stated he is not opposed to an additional building

but would like to see a better scale relationship. He stated his concerns for the rear building remodel and vertical windows being switched out with horizontal windows and concerns that the two buildings differ in style and scale.

Commissioner Castro stated the specific categories and features designated as Cultural Resource have been retained and enhanced with this project proposal. He commended the proposal in its creative and innovative approach and commended the affordable housing aspect of the project.

Commissioner Azar disclosed for the record, he met with the developer to review the project model. He stated he sees this as three separate projects 1) the project to the north; 2) alteration to the rear building; and 3) rehabilitation of the two front buildings. He stated concern that the applicant has not presented any materials for the third project. He recommended the applicant present the project as three separate projects. He commended the applicant in their inclusion of the public with this project. He has concerns with the alterations to the existing structure.

Vice-Chair Joyce disclosed for the record, she met with the developer to review the project model. She stated she agreed with Commissioner Azar's suggestion of breaking the project into three separate projects.

Commissioner Yeber disclosed for the record, he met with the applicant and the developer to discuss the project.

Commissioner Castro disclosed for the record, he met with the applicant and the developer to discuss the project.

POINT OF INFORMATION: Secretary Rome asked if the four Commissioners met with the applicant and/or developer at the same single meeting. The Commissioners stated the meetings were separate meetings.

Chair Hahn and Commissioner Felchlin stated they did not meet with the applicant nor the developer.

Chair Hahn stated the mitigation of the tree wasn't realistic. She requested staff to contact the State regarding the National Register designation status.

ACTION: Chair Hahn called for a motion to approve the staff recommendation to approve the application and adopt Resolution No. HPC 05-63, "A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD RECOMMENDING TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2005-008 TO MAKE ALTERATIONS TO A LOCAL CULTURAL RESOURCE AND CONSTRUCT 32 MARKET-RATE HOUSING UNITS AND REHABILITATE 8 UNITS AS AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS AT 1236-1252 HARPER AVENUE, WEST HOLLYWOOD". **There was no motion made.**

Chair Hahn asked if any Commissioner would like to make any motion revising the staff recommendation.

ACTION: Commissioner Felchlin motioned to: Direct the applicant to look again at the addition to the rear building; to address material and scale issues related to that; to think of the rear building as a separate project from the new building; ensure the new building is compatible to the existing structure; to continue deliberations on the project; and direct the applicant to revise the project and return to the Commission for approval. **Motion by Commissioner Felchlin, seconded by Chair Hahn.**

Chair Hahn opened the floor for Commissioner discussion of the motion.

Commissioner Castro stated he would like added to the motion 1) the applicant will provide more clarification of the rear building with color renderings depicting the materials of the third and fourth levels.

Commissioner Yeber stated his concern with restricting the applicant from building something contemporary as an addendum to an existing Cultural Resource. He stated the Secretary of Interior Standards indicates they clearly do not want to recreate the past. He stated buildings, neighborhoods and communities are not meant to be frozen in time and need to grow, build and add onto and the Secretary of Interior Standards are designed to reflect that. He stated to put a building next to the Cultural Resource that looks like the Cultural Resource goes against the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Commissioner Felchlin stated the proposed building appears to be out of scale, proportion and relationship with the Cultural Resource. He is not opposed to a contemporary or modern structure but felt this proposal was inappropriate to have façade and eight feet of the sides of the original building connected to a modern structure.

Chair Hahn called the question.

AYES: Commissioners Azar, Felchlin, Vice-chair Joyce, Chair Hahn.

NOES: Commissioners: Castro, Yeber.

ABSENT: None.

There was discussion about when item 8.B. will return to the Historic Preservation Commission and clarification of the objection.

9. NEW BUSINESS.

A. HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION "WEST HOLLYWOOD ANTHOLOGY" SUBCOMMITTEE APPOINTMENT:

ACTION: Chair Hahn appointed Vice-Chair Joyce to the West Hollywood Anthology Subcommittee.

10. UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

A. WEST HOLLYWOOD ANTHOLOGY:

Commissioner Felchlin updated the Commission on the status of Committee Members meeting with City Council.

B. HISTORIC RESOURCES SURVEY UPDATE:

Staff Liaison Terry Blount provide the Commission with an update of the City's Historic Resources Survey. He stated as of October 17, 2005 the consultant had reviewed 1,400 properties with 800 still slated and an anticipated additional 200-250 would be reviewed by present date leaving only 600 sites to be reviewed. He stated several properties with active applications for demolition are being reviewed prior to processing the applications.

Chair Hahn asked if any members of the public had participated in the survey. Urban Designer John Chase stated the City solicited public participation but had no response.

Chair Hahn asked the Commissioners interested in the survey to schedule time with the consultant and visit some of the sites.

C. HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION DECEMBER 2005 MEETING:

ACTION: 1) Cancel the Regular Historic Preservation Commission Meeting scheduled for Monday, December 26, 2005. 2) Schedule a Special Meeting for Monday, December 12, 2005 @ 7 PM. **Motion by Commissioner Felchlin, seconded by Commission Yeber and unanimously carried.**

11. ITEMS FROM STAFF:

A. UPCOMING PROJECTS:

Discussion was held regarding the potential upcoming projects that will be heard before the Commission.

B. ANNUAL CONGRESS OF COMMISSIONS & BOARDS:

Chair Hahn commended Vice-Chair Joyce of a job well done.

The Commissioners agreed with Chair Hahn.

Commissioner Yeber thought the Congress was an improved event from prior years.

C. COMMISSIONER TRAINING:

Staff Liaison Terry Blount stated the Commissioner Training Schedule would be provided at the next meeting.

12. HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Commissioner Yeber thanked the Commissioners and Terry Blount for the well wishes of his mother. He also asked staff to update the city records of his email address. He stated his concern with the packets being delivered too late for review and suggested projects missing the scheduled deadline should be carried over to the next available meeting. He offered to assist in any way possible to have the packets arrive in a timely manner. He stated he is receiving City Event mailings delivered after the events occurred.

Commissioner Castro stated similar difficulties are happening in the City of Beverly Hills with their packets.

Commissioner Azar started discussion regarding filling the Historic Preservation Commissioner Vacancy.

Chair Hahn asked the monthly City Rosters be forwarded to the Commissioners. She also thanked Secretary Rome for forwarding West Hollywood Historic facts and articles to the Commissioners via email.

13. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

14. ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 9:19 P.M. to a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission, which will be on Monday, November 28, 2005 at 7:00 P.M. at Plummer Park

Community Center, Rooms 5 & 6, 7377 Santa Monica Boulevard, West Hollywood, California. **Motion carried by consensus of the Commission.**

APPROVED BY A MOTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON THIS 28th DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2005.



CHAIR HAHN

ATTEST:



SECRETARY