



**PLANNING COMMISSION
SUMMARY ACTION MINUTES
Regular Teleconference Meeting
May 20, 2021**

West Hollywood, California

THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD HAS ADOPTED BRIEF SUMMARY AND ACTION MEETING MINUTES, WHICH PROVIDE A SUMMARY OF THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND POINTS OF DISCUSSION ONLY. ADDITIONAL COMMENTS OR DISCUSSION REGARDING ANY ITEM SUMMARIZED IN THESE MINUTES MAY BE OBTAINED BY VIEWING THE ARCHIVED VIDEOS OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETINGS AT www.weho.org/weho-tv/other-city-meetings

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chair Hoopinger called the meeting of the Planning Commission to order at 6:31 p.m.
2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Commissioner Dutta led the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. **ROLL CALL:**
Commissioners Present: Carvalheiro, Dutta, Lombardi, Thomas, Vinson, Vice-Chair Jones, Chair Hoopinger.

Commissioners Absent: None.

Staff Present: Bryan Eck, Senior Planner, Rachel Dimond, Senior Planner, Jennifer Davis, Senior Contract Planner, Alicen Bartle, Project Development Administrator, Rebecca Ehemann, Public Arts Administrator, Veronica Tam, Veronica Tam and Associates, Housing Advisory Lead, Robyn Eason, Long Range Planning Manager, Jennifer Alkire, Current and Historic Preservation Planning Manager, Lauren Langer, City Attorney, and David Gillig, Commission Secretary.
4. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA.**
Approve the Planning Commission agenda of Thursday, May 20, 2021, as presented. **Moved by Vice-Chair Jones, seconded by Commissioner Vinson and unanimously passes.**
5. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES.**
 - A. **May 6, 2021**

ACTION: Continue to Thursday June 3, 2021. **Moved by Vice-Chair Jones, seconded by Commissioner Vinson and unanimously passes as part of the approved agenda.**
6. **PUBLIC COMMENT.** None.

7. DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

John Keho, Director, Planning and Development Services Department stated the following items will be reviewed at the next City Council meeting on Monday, June 7, 2021: 1) a billboard request located at 8752 Sunset Boulevard, and 2) updates to the Housing Element and Robertson Lane Project. He spoke regarding the post pandemic action plan.

8. ITEMS FROM COMMISSIONERS. None.

9. CONSENT CALENDAR. None.

10. PUBLIC HEARINGS.

Commissioner Carvalho recused himself from this item and left the digital meeting platform, stating he has a project located within the Sunset Billboard Program.

A. 9157 Sunset Boulevard:

Jennifer Davis, Senior Contract Planner provided a verbal presentation and background information, as presented in the staff report dated Thursday, May 20, 2021.

She stated the proposal is a request to convert an existing, one-sided static billboard to a new, one-sided digital billboard for off-site advertising. The existing billboard overhangs the current building at an angle to Sunset Boulevard has been on this site since approximately 1960, although the sign face was replaced in 2009. The subject property is developed with a three-story commercial building that was constructed in 1938 in the Streamline Moderne architectural style and designed by Ronald J. Webb, which was designated as a cultural resource in 2019.

The existing static billboard is supported by I-beams on both the eastern and westerns faces of the building. The new billboard will largely be located in the same place as the existing billboard. The new sign is proposed to be taller than the existing billboard by 14 feet with a top height of 72'-10" above Sunset Boulevard.

Named the "Streamlined Arbor," the proposed billboard uses the Streamline Moderne architecture of the building as its design inspiration. The profile of the billboard will be thin because its digital configuration does not require a catwalk in the rear that is typically required for maintaining static billboards. The back will be clad to improve the aesthetics of the rear of the billboard.

At night, in addition to the digital lighting of the sign area itself, the structure will be highlighted by architectural lighting to highlight the tube-shaped support structure.

She stated the Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee reviewed the proposal on March 11, 2021. The subcommittee was generally supportive of the design but suggested the height of the billboard and the massing of the tubular structure could be reduced. The applicant has since reduced the tube diameter from 18" to 16" and removed the lower horizontal tube. She clarified the view analyses.

The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the proposal on Monday, April 26, 2021. The commission was supportive of the billboard design being higher above the historic building, and they requested the Planning Commission consider changes to the architectural lighting.

Staff is recommending approval of the proposed billboard to the City Council.

The commission questioned the entitlement approach, the rear cladding material and height. They requested clarification regarding the Historic Preservation Commission's comments regarding the architectural lighting and asked staff to elaborate on the Sunset Boulevard Off-Site Signage section regarding light levels.

Chair Hoopingarner opened the public hearing for Item 10.A.

JEFFREY A. SEYMOUR, WEST LAKE VILLAGE, Seymour Consulting Group, applicant's representative presented the applicant's report. He provided a history of the property and the team presenting.

BEN ANDERSON, LOS ANGELES, architect, continued the applicant's report. He spoke and detailed the billboard read and vantage points, architectural style, rehabilitation of the building, design documentation, elevations, materials and cladding, the reduction of the structural diameter, lighting, and ambient lighting.

The commission requested clarification and questioned the finish of the columns and paint reflectivity, the offset, and dimensions of the columns in relation to the buildings round window, egress of the staircase, size of the backing perforations, placement of the billboard's logo, architectural lighting, light and shadow, timelines, and neighboring billboard designs.

JAKE STEVENS, LOS ANGELES spoke in support of staff's recommendation of approval.

ACTION: Close public hearing for Item 10.A. **Motion carried by consensus of the Commission.**

Vice-Chair Jones disclosed for the record she spoke with the applicant's representative and architect. They discussed items contained in the staff report.

Commissioner Thomas disclosed for the record she met with the applicant's representative and made a site visit. They discussed matters contained in the staff report.

Commissioner Lombardi disclosed for the record he spoke with the applicant's representative and architect and made a site visit. They discussed items contained in the staff report.

Commissioner Dutta disclosed for the record he spoke with the applicant's representative and architect and made a site visit. They discussed items contained in the staff report.

Chair Hoopingarner disclosed for the record she made a site visit.

Commissioner Vinson had no official disclosures.

The commission discussed and had concerns with the overall height of the billboard, pedestrian experience and the built environment, architectural lighting, light trespass and impacts on quality of life in residential areas, luminance and illuminance, the driving experience heading east from Beverly Hills and the possible impacts of a possible future gateway project, position of the billboard logo, and the amount of metallic flecks in the paint.

The commission requested clarification regarding the digital lighting analyses, sales of billboards, mobile billboards, and building occupancy.

Additional discussion was held regarding the height, position of the billboard logo or imprint, lighting from a design perspective, and the Historic Preservation Commission's recommendation regarding architectural lighting.

It was suggested that possible language addressing protected views could be added, an amendment to the resolution addressing the blocking of the window, future evaluation, and lighting should be provided from the roof and not affect the neighbors.

The commission reiterated their concerns that the Historic Preservation Commission did not receive renderings of the billboard with a logo.

Chair Hoopingarner moved to: 1) approve staff's recommendation to City Council, with the following recommendations: a) the billboard logo shall either not be included or presented in such a way as not to impinge upon the design of the structure, b) any lighting of the armature, shall be placed in such a way as to not be on the armature, and the lighting fixtures shall not be visible, c) language in the development agreement regarding view shed protections, and d) City Council may consider reducing the height if appropriate.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Jones.

Lauren Langer, City Attorney clarified the language regarding the development agreement in draft Resolution No. PC 21-1391. page 18 of 44, Section 5 - Obstruction. The parties acknowledge and agree that nothing in this Agreement serves to impair, limit, or diminish the City's police power ~~authority~~ and discretion to consider and act upon applications for development projects in the vicinity ~~of the Property~~, and that this Agreement does not confer upon the Owner a right to an unobstructed view of the Permitted Sign. The parties further acknowledge and agree that nothing in this Agreement, including this subsection, shall serve to impair, limit, or diminish Owner's right to comment upon, object to, or legally challenge a development project in the vicinity of the Property. Owner shall not remove or cut any tree located on a property adjacent to the Property to remove obstruction to the Approved Sign. Each tree removed from City property at the request of the Owner to remove obstruction to the Approved Sign shall be replaced at the expense of the Owner by four (4) new trees with at least a 48" box dimension within the City of West Hollywood. City shall, in a reasonably prompt manner following Owner's reasonable request from time to time, trim the trees located on public property at Sunset Boulevard and Cory Avenue (and any replacement thereof) as reasonably necessary to retain visibility of the Permitted Sign looking eastward down Sunset Boulevard. City shall not unreasonably deny Owner's request for tree trimming if made prior to City's annual tree trimming exercise. In lieu of repeated trimming of any obstructing trees, Owner (or any Tenant) may request to adjust the Approved Sign location and orientation as allowed by the Specific Plan Section 4.C.5.d.

Amend draft Resolution No. PC 21-1393, Section 10. Based on the foregoing, the Planning Commission of the City of West Hollywood hereby recommends that the City Council approve Sign Permit (BB20-0002) and Certificate of Appropriateness (COA20-0009, subject to the following conditions: a) there shall be no logo on the sign; b) show visuals there is no lighting fixtures on any of the armature columns or structure and to be shielded from view and not aimed towards neighboring properties; and c) consider reductions in height that maintain an appropriate separation from the historic structure.

Commissioner Lombardi requested an amendment to the motion: a) include a full set of lighting standards that exist in the Ordinance; which include the daytime and nighttime luminance standards.

Chair Hoopingarner agreed to the amendment.

Vice-Chair Jones agreed to the amendment.

The Commission expressed concerns that the media company logo was not included in the plans presented to Historic Preservation Commission and if it were to be included, the project would need to be sent back to Historic Preservation Commission for review.

Commissioner Hoopingarner amended the motion by adding: 2) there shall be no logo on the sign.

Vice-Chair Jones agreed to this amendment.

Lauren Langer, City Attorney stated draft Resolution No, PC 21-1393 shall be amended as follows: Condition 3.3) The proposed billboard must meet all standards in Section 5 and Section 6 of the Sunset Boulevard Off-Site Signage Policy. Within six months of installation, a Lighting Monitoring Report is required and at three-year intervals thereafter pursuant to this Section of the Policy. This shall be submitted to the Planning & Development Services Department for review and approval. Per the Sunset Strip Off-Site Signage Policy, new billboard operations are required to use the highest available clean energy tier from the City's energy provider to the extent feasible. As such, the proposed project operator would be required to purchase electricity specifically from renewable sources, which would decrease the project's consumption of nonrenewable energy and its contribution to greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. These requirements are also described in Development Agreement DA20-0002.

ACTION: 1) Approve staff's recommendation to City Council; 2) **Adopt Resolution No. PC 21-1391 as amended:** *a) amend Section 5 - Obstruction. "The parties acknowledge and agree that nothing in this Agreement serves to impair, limit, or diminish the City's police power authority and discretion to consider and act upon applications for development projects in the vicinity of the Property, and that this Agreement does not confer upon the Owner a right to an unobstructed view of the Permitted Sign. The parties further acknowledge and agree that nothing in this Agreement, including this subsection, shall serve to impair, limit, or diminish Owner's right to comment upon, object to, or legally challenge a development project in the vicinity of the Property. Owner shall not remove or cut any tree located on a property adjacent to the Property to remove obstruction to the Approved Sign. Each tree removed from City property at the request of the Owner to remove obstruction to the Approved Sign shall be replaced at the expense of the Owner by four (4) new trees with at least a 48" box dimension within the City of West Hollywood. City shall, in a reasonably prompt manner following Owner's reasonable request from time to time, trim the trees located on public property at Sunset Boulevard and Cory Avenue (and any replacement thereof) as reasonably necessary to retain visibility of the Permitted Sign looking eastward down Sunset Boulevard. City shall not unreasonably deny Owner's request for tree trimming if made prior to City's annual tree trimming exercise. In lieu of*

repeated trimming of any obstructing trees, Owner (or any Tenant) may request to adjust the Approved Sign location and orientation as allowed by the Specific Plan Section 4.C.5.d.”; “A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF A DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE NEW OFF-SITE ADVERTISING BILLBOARD, LOCATED AT 9157 SUNSET BOULEVARD, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA”;

3) Adopt Resolution No. PC 21-1392 as presented: “A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF A ZONING MAP AMENDMENT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE NEW OFF-SITE ADVERTISING BILLBOARD, LOCATED AT 9157 SUNSET BOULEVARD, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA”;

4) Adopt Resolution No. PC 21-1393 as amended: *b) amend Section 10. “Based on the foregoing, the Planning Commission of the City of West Hollywood hereby recommends that the City Council approve Sign Permit (BB20-0002) and Certificate of Appropriateness (COA20-0009, subject to the following conditions: a) there shall be no logo on the sign; b) show visuals there is no lighting fixtures on any of the armature columns or structure and to be shielded from view and not aimed towards neighboring properties; and c) consider reductions in height that maintain an appropriate separation from the historic structure.”; c) amend Condition 3.3) “The proposed billboard must meet all standards in Section 5 and Section 6 of the Sunset Boulevard Off-Site Signage Policy. Within six months of installation, a Lighting Monitoring Report is required and at three-year intervals thereafter pursuant to this Section of the Policy. This shall be submitted to the Planning & Development Services Department for review and approval. Per the Sunset Strip Off-Site Signage Policy, new billboard operations are required to use the highest available clean energy tier from the City’s energy provider to the extent feasible. As such, the proposed project operator would be required to purchase electricity specifically from renewable sources, which would decrease the project’s consumption of nonrenewable energy and its contribution to greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. These requirements are also described in Development Agreement DA20-0002.”; “A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF A SIGN PERMIT AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE NEW OFF-SITE ADVERTISING BILLBOARD, LOCATED AT 9157 SUNSET BOULEVARD, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA”;* and 5) Close the Public Hearing for Item 10.A. **Moved by Chair Hoopingarner, seconded by Vice-Chair Jones and passes, noting Commissioner Carvalho recused.**

THE COMMISSION TOOK A FIVE (5) MINUTE RECESS AT 8:40 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 8:45 P.M.

Commissioner Carvalho returned to the digital meeting platform at this time.

**B. Zone Text Amendment
Urban Art Program Guidelines:**

Bryan Eck, Senior Planner provided a verbal presentation and background information, as presented in the staff report dated Thursday, May 20, 2021.

He stated the proposal is to consider recommending to the City Council an amendment to the West Hollywood Zoning Ordinance, to amend that section governing project exemptions from the Urban Art Program Guidelines to include all affordable housing projects and city-led capital improvement projects.

The proposed update Section §19.38 of the West Hollywood Municipal Code would remove those exemptions and expand the applicable development types to include all affordable housing and capital improvement projects. The Urban Art Program requires developers of most projects greater than \$200,000 to place art on-site equal in value to 1% of the project value, or to place an equal amount into the West Hollywood Public Art and Beautification Fund (Art Fund).

On March 1, 2021, the City Council approved an updated version of the Urban Art Program Guidelines. In addition to approval of the guidelines, the Council directed staff to initiate a zone text amendment needed to codify and implement the addition of the new project categories.

The intent of the proposed change is to align the Urban Art Program with the principles and recommendations established in the WeHo Arts:

There were no public speakers.

The commission stated they are in support of the arts but had concerns about requiring affordable housing to include art or having a percentage of the total project cost go into an art fund. They elaborated on and stated their issues with the current extensive process for building affordable housing. They would not like to see any additional obstacles or deterrents to build affordable housing in the city.

Rebecca Ehemann, Public Art Administrator clarified the intent to bring art to the public.

Discussion was held regarding the cost basis to developers, bringing art to people who would normally not be able to access it, priorities, incentives, integration, and the art approval process. They commented on and detailed how art is fundamental to the core of West Hollywood.

Commissioner Carvalho moved to: 1) approve staff's recommendation as presented.

Seconded by Commissioner Vinson.

The commission requested clarification regarding the number of current and in development projects in the urban art collection.

ACTION: 1) Approve staff's recommendation to City Council; 2) **Adopt Resolution No. PC 21-1405 as presented:** "A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF A ZONE TEXT AMENDMENT TO REMOVE EXEMPTIONS FROM THE CITY'S URBAN ART PROGRAM GUIDELINES TO INCLUDE ALL AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS AND CITY-LED CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA"; and 3) Close the Public Hearing for Item 10.B. **Moved by Commissioner Carvalho, seconded by Commissioner Vinson and passes, noting Commissioner Thomas, Vice-Chair Jones, and Chair Hoopingarner voting NO.**

11. NEW BUSINESS.

- A. Reappointments to the Planning Commission Design Review Subcommittee, Long Range Planning Projects Subcommittee, Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee, and 1343 Laurel Avenue Visions Concept Committee, for partial terms to June 30, 2021.**

Design Review Subcommittee:

ACTION: Appoint: 1) Michael A. Lombardi to the Design Review Subcommittee for a partial term through June 30, 2021.

Members: Lynn Hoopingarner, Chair, Rogerio Carvalho, and Michael A. Lombardi.

Long-Range Planning Projects Subcommittee:

ACTION: Appoint: 1) Tushar R. Dutta to the Long-Range Planning Projects Subcommittee for a partial term through June 30, 2021.

Members: Stacey E. Jones, Chair, Tushar R. Dutta, and Katrina Vinson.

Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee:

ACTION: Appoint: 1) Michael A. Lombardi for a partial term through June 30, 2021.

Members: Lynn Hoopingarner, Chair, Stacey E. Jones, and Michael A. Lombardi

1343 Laurel Avenue Visions Concept Committee:

ACTION: Appoint: 1) Tushar R. Dutta for a partial term through June 30, 2021.

Members: Rogerio Carvalheiro, Tushar R. Dutta.

B. Extend the Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee Meeting Dates.

ACTION: 1) Extend the special meeting dates of the Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee to be held on the 2nd Thursday of every month as needed through Thursday, December 9, 2021; and 2) cancel the regularly scheduled meetings of the Design Review Subcommittee on those dates that an agenda is legally posted for the Sunset Arts and Advertising Subcommittee. **Moved by Chair Hoopingarner, seconded by Commissioner Lombardi and unanimously passes.**

12. UNFINISHED BUSINESS.

A. Housing Element Discussion.

This discussion item was officially continued from Thursday, May 6, 2021.

Rachel Dimond, Senior Planner provided a verbal presentation and background information, as presented in the staff report dated Thursday, May 20, 2021.

She stated the purpose of this meeting is to continue the discussion on the draft framework of housing policies, constraints to housing production, and a toolkit of policy options. Staff continues to seek input on these items from the Planning Commission and the public as part of the public engagement process to formulate the Housing Element Update. Staff will return to the Planning Commission on June 3, 2021, to discuss the draft sites inventory.

She reiterated the Housing Element is a state-required chapter in the City of West Hollywood General Plan. It provides an indication of the need for housing in the community, particularly the availability, affordability, and adequacy of housing. The Housing Element specifically plans for the ability to locate and construct the units required as part of the City's Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) allocation. This will be the State's sixth eight-year planning cycle, with the upcoming cycle for the time period of October 2021 to October 2029. State law requires the city to update and submit its Housing Element to the State Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) for state certification by October 15, 2021. There is, however, an opportunity to extend the deadline (SB 375), and staff is adjusting the proposed schedule to allow for final submittal in January 2022 as permitted by state law. This will allow for additional meetings with the community, task force, Planning Commission, related commissions and boards, and the City Council.

Staff will focus discussion on the proposed goals and policies as well as constraints that hinder housing production. Staff will delay discussion of where the housing may go to June 17, 2021, Planning Commission meeting until after staff has been able to thoroughly review the draft inventory map.

She stated at the Planning Commission on May 6, 2021, an additional EIR scoping meeting has been added on May 25, 2021, at 6:30pm. On June 7, 2021, City Council will provide additional guidance on the role of the task force, community engagement process, and timeline for the adoption of the final housing element. At that meeting, staff will propose extending the timeline to accommodate the deadline extension permitted by the state, along with a more robust public engagement process moving forward.

She spoke and detailed constraints to housing, market and financial constraints, governmental constraints, policy considerations, housing element policy framework, goals and policies, and changes in language.

The commission questioned the implications if developers were not able to build the number of units required by RHNA numbers over the next eight years. They requested clarification regarding the EIR and scoping process, timelines, existing policies, traffic modelling, green space, construction, and site inventory.

Chair Hoopingarner opened public comment for Item 12.A.

STEPHANIE HARKER, WEST HOLLYWOOD has concerns regarding this item. She spoke and questioned if there will be new standards for the housing element, timelines, public comment and public outreach, historic preservation, and traffic infrastructure.

LYNN RUSSELL, WEST HOLLYWOOD has concerns regarding this item. She spoke regarding the urban environment, energy conservation, construction and value, and public participation.

ACTION: Close public comment for Item 12.A. **Motion carried by consensus of the Commission.**

The commission commented on changes in language, cultural resources and historic preservation, construction costs and restraints, community guidance and engagement, scoping meetings, and subject matter.

ACTION: Continue the discussion to Thursday, June 3, 2021. **Motion carried by consensus of the Commission.**

13. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR. None.

14. ITEMS FROM STAFF.

A. Planning Manager's Update.

Robyn Eason, Long Range Planning Manager provided an update of tentative items scheduled for upcoming Planning Commission, Design Review Subcommittee, Long Range Planning Projects Subcommittee, and the Sunset Arts & Advertising Subcommittee meetings.

15. PUBLIC COMMENT.

STEPHANIE HARKER, WEST HOLLYWOOD commented on housing and infrastructure.

LYNN RUSSELL, WEST HOLLYWOOD commented on public art.

16. ITEMS FROM COMMISSIONERS.

A. Commissioner Comments.

Commissioner Thomas stated she does not support language articulated by a member of the public that ridicules, denigrate or marginalizes any group of people.

B. Subcommittee Management. None.

17. ADJOURNMENT. The Planning Commission adjourned at 10:37 p.m. to a regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday, June 3, 2021, beginning at 6:30 p.m. Given the local, state and nation state of emergency, this meeting will be a teleconferenced meeting (with detailed instructions for participation included on the posted agenda). **Motion carried by consensus of the Commission.**

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Planning Commission of the City of West Hollywood at a regular meeting held this 17th day of June 2021 by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioner: Carvalho, Dutta, Jones, Lombardi, Thomas, Vinson, Vice-Chair Jones, Chair Hoopingarnier.

NOES: Commissioner: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner: None.

ABSTAIN: Commissioner: None.



LYNN M. HOOPINGARNER, CHAIRPERSON

ATTEST:



DAVID K. GILLIG, COMMISSION SECRETARY