

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 28, 2019 – 7:00 P.M.

1. CALL TO ORDER Chair LaJoie called the meeting to order at

7:01pm

2. ADMINISTER THE OATH OF OFFICE: Councilmember John Duran thanked the HPC for their service to the community and administered the Oath of Office to appointee Francesco Gallo.

3. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair LaJoie, Commissioners Levin,

Ostergren, Dubin and Gallo

ABSENT: Vice-Chair Charlie and Davidson

STAFF PRESENT: Doug Vu Senior Planner AICP/HPC Liaison,

Jennifer Alkire CHPP Manager, Roger Rath, Assistant Planner, Gurdeep Kaur, Assistant Planner and Sharita Houston HPC-Secretary.

OTHERS PRESENT: Nels Youngborg, Consultant Chattel, Inc.

4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the agenda.

Action: Approve the regular meeting agenda of Monday, October 28, 2019 as presented. Motion by Commissioner Levin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed.

- APPROVAL OF MINUTES:
 - A. AUGUST 26, 2019: The HPC is requested to approve the minutes of prior Commission meetings.

Action: Approve the regular meeting minutes of August 26, 2019 as amended. Motion by Commissioner Levin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed, noting an abstention by Commissioner Dubin.

B. OCTOBER 02, 2019: The HPC is requested to approve the minutes of prior Commission meetings.

Action: Approve the special meeting minutes of October 2, 2019 as amended. Motion by Commissioner Levin, second by Commissioner Dubin and motion passed, noting an abstention by Commissioner Ostergren.

- 6. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.
- 7. CONSENT CALENDAR:

A. COMPLETE COUNT COMMITTEE (CCC) CENSUS 2020 UPDATE.

SUBJECT: The Historic Preservation Commission received summary notes from the CCC meeting held Thursday, September 18, 2019. **Action:** Receive and file the CCC Consensus 2020 Update summary.

Motion by Commissioner Levin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed.

8. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR: None.

9. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

A. 8901 SUNSET BOULEVARD CULTURAL RESOURCE DESIGNATION:
Continued from the October 2, 2019 special HPC meeting. Request for
Cultural Resource Designation for property located at 8901 Sunset
Boulevard, West Hollywood, California.

CHAIR LAJOIE recused himself from discussion of the item; lives within 500-feet of the property.

STAFF GURDEEP KAUR provided a presentation detailing information from the October 28, 2019 staff report that was also presented at the October 2, 2019 Special HPC meeting with public speaker comments.

She addressed information relating to application submittal, zoning and the properties date of construction. She stated the distinctive characteristics of the building's 1920's Art Deco style and said its characteristics have been retained.

She said the property remains as originally constructed, retains sufficient levels of all seven aspects of integrity and continues to convey its historic significance.

She said Staff supports the applicant's proposal that the building is eligible for designation under Criterion C, Identified with Persons or Events and Staff determined that the building is eligible for designation under the following criterion as well:

- Criterion A1: It embodies distinctive characteristics of a period, method, style, or type of construction
- Criterion A3: It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of growth and settlement
- Criterion A5: It has a unique location or singular physical characteristic or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city.
- Criterion B: It is one of the few remaining examples in the city, region, state or nation, possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen

She said Staff recommends that the HPC adopt the following resolution recommending that City Council approve to designate the property:

DRAFT RESOLUTION NO. HPC 19-139: A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 8901 SUNSET BOULEVARD, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA AS A LOCAL CULTURAL RESOURCE.

Item 9.A. Public Comment:

APPLICANT HEATHER GOERS OF HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP (HRG), provided an extensive, detailed presentation regarding the history of the Whisky à Go Go and said the venue is one of the most popular in the history of live performance entertainment on the Sunset Strip.

She stated its significance in association with the development of the Sunset Strip and gave detailed information regarding the history of the Strip in relationship to restaurants and nightclubs and the Whisky.

She provided a brief history of building owner/developer, Elmer Valentine and further discussed the history of the building and its construction. She talked about the opening date of the Whisky à Go Go and spoke about previous uses and themes within the nightclub's venue.

She said the Whisky à Go Go later became the destination of iconic up and coming artists from the rock-n-roll genre and said it was the first to book African American artists in a night club, particularly Motown artists during that era.

She explained the impact and role of the Whisky à Go Go on the development of popular music, development of the Sunset Strip and its contributions to West Hollywood's character and identity.

DAN MORIN, WEST HOLLYWOOD said he fully supports the designation, reiterated previous comments and spoke about the building's iconic presence in West Hollywood.

SHELIA LIGHTFOOT WEST HOLLYWOOD reiterated previous comments in support of the designation. She stated names of previous public speakers and members of the public that previously completed citizen position slips in support of the designation.

VICTOR OMELCZENKO WEST HOLLYWOOD/WEST HOLLYWOOD PRESERVATION ALLIANCE (WHPA) commented about public speakers that previously spoke in support of the designation, he spoke about the

building's potential for designation on local, state and federal levels and said the WHPA supports the designation.

ACTING CHAIR LEVIN read into the record the following individuals that completed Citizen Position Slips In Lieu of Speaking in support of the designation:

KIMBERLY COPELAND STEVEN ANDREWS PAT DIXON MICHAEL HADDAD BRYAN MAYEDA JAMES S. NOLL COLIN M. SPITTER CATHY BLAIVAS STEPHANIE HARKER

Item 9.A. Commissioner Questions to Applicant:

COMMISSIONER GALLO, STAFF AND APPLICANT HEATHER GOERS discussed photos submitted in the application package and the current condition of the existing structure.

Item 9.A. Public Comment Closed

Item 9.A. Commissioner Comments:

COMMISSIONER DUBIN thanked the public for their attendance and the applicant for the presentation. He recommended that HRG include elements of the presentation at the building and said he supports the designation.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. She commended HRG for the presentation and said she agrees with Commissioner Dubins recommendation regarding the presentation available at the site.

COMMISSIONER GALLO spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He said he would like more architectural details regarding the site but supports the designation.

ACTING CHAIR LEVIN spoke in favor of Staffs recommendation. He said the Whisky à Go Go was significant in the development of the Sunset Strip and commented about various entertainers and genres of music previously at the venue. He recommended the following changes to the resolution:

A. Exemplifies Special Elements of the City.

Section 5: The position of the Whisky à Go Go building at 8901 Sunset Boulevard represents an established and familiar vista. San Vicente Boulevard climbs up the hillside and slightly angles after it crosses Sunset Boulevard. This slightly offsets the corner property at the northwest

intersection, drawing it further out into the intersection. The resulting asymmetry gives a highlighted prominence to the 8901 Sunset Boulevard building. Furthermore, the building is placed exceptionally close to the corner with zero setbacks. This is the view that the visitor catches, either coming northbound on San Vicente Boulevard or from west-bound on Sunset Boulevard has become an iconic image of the Sunset Strip, West Hollywood, Los Angeles, and Southern California. It has been featured in books, in movie and TV scenes depicting Los Angeles, and news articles to represent Los Angeles. The Whisky à Go Go establishes a fundamental sense of place. A The Whisky à Go Go represents a significant building forming the cultural memory of the City".

B. Example of Distinguishing Characteristics.

The subject property is an excellent example of Art Deco architecture with a high degree of integrity. It is one of the few remaining examples in the city that embodies the character-defining features of the Art Deco style that defined the era of rapid urban growth of the booming 1920s. It is a rare example in West Hollywood of an Art Deco commercial building. Art Deco architecture generally focuses on verticality in design and this is a rare example of a building in the Art Deco style that is not exceptionally tall. This <u>^/Its</u> human scale allows the viewer to capture the entire design whether they are walking or driving by. The building maintains all its character-defining features and retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials and feeling to convey its significance.

C: Identified with Persons or Events:

The building at 8901 Sunset Boulevard has a long history of association with people and events significant to not only local and state, but national and international history as well. Its first significant association is to the founder of the Whisky à Go Go, Elmer Valentine. The owner and curator of the nightclub helped create the rock 'n' roll era through his evaluation and support for the young merging <u>hemerging</u> artists he booked to perform.

SECTION 5. Based upon the foregoing criteria, the Historic Preservation Commission finds that the exterior of the building includes the following character defining features:

- Smooth stucco
- Scored cement plaster zigzags
- Chevrons
- Stylized floral and geometric motifs
- Fixed-sash windows
- Simple massing
- Flat roof with parapet
- Decorative cornice
- Original Alcoves

COMMISSIONER DUBIN moved to approve Draft HPC Resolution No. 19-139 as amended, second by Commissioner Ostergren.

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes October 28, 2019 Page 6 of 13

Action: Approve and adopt Draft Resolution No. HPC 19-139 as amended. Motion by Commissioner Dubin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed on roll call vote:

AYES:

Gallo, Dubin, Ostergren Levin

NOES

None

ABSENT:

Charlie, Davidson

ABSTAIN:

None

RECUSALS:

LaJoie

B. 7965-7985 SANTA MONICA BOULEVARD (FRENCH MARKET): Request to revise previous resolution regarding the rehabilitation of cultural resource (French Market Building) and construct new, 49.5-foottall, three-story commercial building. Uses include office, restaurant, retail, bar, design showroom and two levels of parking, located at 7965-7985 Santa Monica Boulevard. (French Market Project).

Action: Continued to the next regular scheduled Historic Preservation Commission meeting, November 25, 2019.

Item 9.B. Public Comment:

DAN MORIN WEST HOLLYWOOD commented about the proposed changes, he said it will alter the structure but supports the project.

Item 9.B. Public Comment Closed

C. 1251 N. DETROIT STREET: Continued from the August 26, HPC meeting. Request for Cultural Resource Designation of 1251 N. Detroit Street, West Hollywood, California.

STAFF GURDEEP KAUR provided a presentation detailing information from the October 28, 2019 staff report; continued from the August 26, 2019 meeting.

She addressed information relating to application submittal, style, scale location and construction of the property. She said there's a two-story duplex at the rear of the structure that is not considered for designation because it does not contribute to the historical significance of the property.

She said the 2008 Multi-Family Survey report states that the rare property type possesses all the character-defining features of West Hollywood's Craftsman architecture and listed its architectural and character defining features.

She said although the subject property has undergone interior and exterior alterations, the building continues to possess a high degree of integrity

therefore Staff believes that this nomination meets the City's criteria for designating a cultural resource.

She said the structure is eligible for designation under the following Criterion and said Staff recommends that the Commission adopt the draft resolution recommending City Council approve the proposed nomination:

Criteria A1: Embodies distinctive characteristics of a period, method, style or type of construction.

Criteria B: It is one of the few remaining examples in the city, region, state or nation, possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen.

Item 9.C. Public Comment:

APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVES MARK YEBER, EL SEGUNDO CA AND PAM O'CONNOR, KAPLAN CHAN KAPLAN provided a presentation of information as submitted in the application on behalf of the property owner, against Staff's recommendation for designation as a cultural resource.

He said the property has had three historic analysis/evaluations, one recommending designation and the others against designation. He said a Peer Review was also conducted by the City's Historic Resources Consultant in August 2018 which supports designation of the property and introduced Pam O'Connor to complete the presentation.

APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVE PAM O'CONNOR, KAPLAN CHAN KAPLAN and author of the Historic Resources Evaluation prepared December 15, 2017 further explained the purpose of the item before the Commission.

She addressed information noted in the analysis and evaluations. She said the building does not merit designation based on the recommended criterion. She discussed information provided in previous Sanborn maps submitted in the application package and said the maps indicate that the area previously consisting of single-family and duplex structures now include commercial structures.

She said the building does not meet criterion for a specific architectural style or location, said the building was built seventy years before West Hollywood Cityhood, the block or area does not maintain a historic district status and the existing duplexes have not been sufficiently determined as a rare property type in the City.

She also said there's no evidence that historic people or events were at the building, therefore the property does not merit designation and asked that the Commission deny the request.

Item 9.C. Questions from Commissioners to Applicant:

COMMISSIONER LEVIN AND APPLICANT MARK YEBER discussed the purpose of the item which was to determine designation eligibility as a result of a conflict between competing authoritative opinions.

COMMISSIONER DUBIN AND APPLICANT MARK YEBER discussed information relating to the original Historic Resources Assessment (HRA).

APLICANT MARK YEBER said the original HRA, prepared by Leslie Heumann was obtained by the previous owner. The owner at that time did not go forward with a cultural resource designation.

Item 9.C. Questions from Commissioners to Staff:

COMMISSIONER LEVIN, STAFF AND CONSULTANT NELS YOUNGBORG discussed a potential conflict of interest as a result of Leslie Heumann, author of the original HRA and now associate with Chattel Inc, during the preparation of the Peer Review prepared August 30, 2018

COMMISSIONER LEVIN said he was concerned that there could be a conflict of interest if she in fact was an associate at that time.

STAFF JENNIFER ALKIRE, CHPP MANAGER said although Staff was aware of Leslie Heumann's possible employment with Chattel during the preparation of the Peer Review it will not be the only deciding factor concerning designation eligibility. She said Staff is required to review and assess all information once provided to the City as a whole of the record.

DAN MORIN WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to designate the property. He addressed Pam O'Connor's comments about the origin of the property and said it now exists within the confines of West Hollywood.

LYNN RUSSEL WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to designate the property. She commented on the three reports, said she supports the Peer Review by Chattel, Inc and supports the designation.

VICTOR OMELCZENKO WEST HOLLYWOOD/WHPA spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to designate the property as presented. He said the Alliance firmly supports designation, agrees with the 2017 HRA report by Leslie Heumann and the August 2018Peer Review by Chattel, Inc.

DAVE MONKS HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staffs recommendation. He thanked the Commission for their input on the property and said the building maintains the historic craftsman style and said he supports designation.

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes October 28, 2019 Page 9 of 13

CHAIR LAJOIE read into the record the following individuals that completed Citizen Position Slips In Lieu of Speaking in support of the designation:

KIMBERLY COPELAND STEVEN ANDREWS PAT DIXON BRYAN MAYEDA JAMES S. NOLL. COLIN M. SPITTER STEPHANIE HARKER

Item 9.C. APPLICANT RESPONSE:

APPLICANT MARK YEBER said the Heumann and Chattel, Inc relationship dates to 2013 and said he recently provided a history for the business association to Staff.

He said 1251 Detroit does not add to the narrative of the City. He questioned if there was evidence to support the building as a rare contributing craftsman bungalow in West Hollywood and requested that the Commission extensively review the information provided.

Item 9.C. Public Comments closed

Item 9.C Commissioner Comments:

COMMISSIONER LEVIN spoke about the Commissions purview concerning an item, with owner requesting to deny an application of designation and reiterated his concerns about a potential conflict of interest with Leslie Heumann & Chattel, Inc's association.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN commented about the lack of information on the rarity of the craftsman duplex property type.

COMMISSIONER DUBIN commented about the building maintaining sufficient integrity.

COMMISSIONER GALLO said there was not enough information to determine a potential conflict of interest.

CHAIR LAJOIE said he too has concerns with a potential conflict of interest with Leslie Heumann and Chattel Inc. He said the property possibly merits designation based rare property type but found that there have been alterations that question its integrity.

COMMISSIONERS LEVIN, DUBIN, OSTERGREN AND CHAIR LAJOIE discussed the issues of designating the property as an individual resource on its merits and/or integrity and the conflict of interest with the process and concluded that the Commission's vote is to be based on the integrity of the property solely.

Motion by Commissioner Dubin to adopt Draft HPC Resolution HPC 19-137 and seconded by Commissioner Ostergren. Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes October 28, 2019 Page 10 of 13

Action: Approve and adopt Draft Resolution No. HPC 19-137 as presented. Motion by Commissioner Dubin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed on roll call vote:

AYES:

Gallo, Dubin, Ostergren, Levin

NOES

LaJoie

ABSENT:

Charlie, Davidson

ABSTAIN:

None

RECUSALS:

None

NOTE: Commissioner Levin requests that the conflict of interest concerning Leslie Heumann and the Peer Review report prepared by Chattel, Inc be fully documented for City Council.

DRAFT RESOLUTION NO. HPC 19-137: A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL DESIGNATE THE FRONT DUPLEX AS A LOCAL CULTURAL RESOURCE FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1251 N. DETROIT STREET, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA.

THE COMMISSION TOOK A FIVE-MINUTE RECESS AT 7:43 PM

MEETING RECONVIENED AT 7:49 PM

D. 8250 FOUNTAIN AVENUE: Request to enter into A Mills Act Contract for the rehabilitation of 8250 Fountain Avenue (Four Gables).

STAFF, ROGER RATH provided a presentation detailing information in the October 28, 2019 staff report. He addressed information relating to the application, project location, zoning and its construction.

He said the Four Gables is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and the City of West Hollywood's Register of Cultural resources as part of the North Harper Avenue Historic District.

He said the property largely retains its character defining features but needs restoration and discussed the process of preparing the proposed work plan. He said items in the work plan will be subject to a Certificate of Appropriateness and all work must be performed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

He addressed required actions of the Commission relating to the application for completeness, the contract for adequacy and final recommendations to the City Council.

He said the building is also privately owned and is not exempt from taxation; for these reasons, the property owner is eligible to receive rehabilitation incentives and benefits under the City's Mills Act program.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN disclosed that he lives within 500-feet of the property but lives in a rent stabilized unit therefore he has no need to be recused.

He also disclosed that his firm previously worked with the owner on a different property but is no longer under contract at this time.

Item 9.D. Questions to Staff:

MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION, STAFF AND NELS YOUNGBORG discussed the annual costs to the City within the worksheet, inconsistencies within elements of the work plan relating to internal and external character defining features and elements of the building that are listed as original, compatible and non-compatible.

It was recommended that the consultant review and update the work plan to correct the inconsistencies and Staff create a template of a preferred workplan for future use.

NELS YOUNGBORG AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISISON further discussed the character defining features within the work plan particularly concerns by Commissioner Dubin about potential internal character defining features.

They addressed elements of the property that are not character features but require repair/rehabilitation and the importance of identifying the character defining features to ensure they're preserved and protected.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN asked if there would be language added in the work plan to prioritize urgent items.

Nels Youngborg said requirements to prioritize certain elements of the contract which implore the applicant to complete and prioritize urgent projects are noted in the Mills Act Contract, see page 3 and section 4-B:

B. Owner shall, where necessary, restore and rehabilitate the Historic Property according to the rules and regulations of the Office of Historic Preservation of the State Department of Parks and Recreation and the City of West Hollywood. Attached as Exhibit 4 is a rehabilitation and maintenance plan for the property. The restoration, rehabilitation and maintenance plan may be modified as necessary to maintain the structural integrity of the building. Owner shall submit an annual review of the work completed and work scheduled for the following year.

MEMBERS OF THE COMMISION, STAFF AND THE PROPERTY OWNER DISCUSSED information relating to ownership, costs of previously completed repairs at the property, and discussed the purpose of excluding the garage from the Mills Act Contract.

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes October 28, 2019 Page 12 of 13

COMMISISONER LEVIN provided minor edits/recommendations to the work plan and moved to approve Staff's recommendation of the Mills Act Contract, second by Commissioner Ostergren.

CHAIR LAJOIE read into the record the following individuals that completed Citizen Position Slips In Lieu of Speaking in support of the Mills Act Contract:

KIMBERLY COPELAND LYNN RUSSEL VITCOR OMELCZENKO

Action: Approve the request to enter into A Mills Act Contract for the rehabilitation of 8250 Fountain Avenue (Four Gables) Motion by Commissioner Levin, second by Commissioner Ostergren and motion passed unanimously on roll call vote:

AYES: Gallo, Dubin, Ostergren, Levin and LaJoie

NOES None

ABSENT: Charlie, Davidson

ABSTAIN: None RECUSALS: None

10. **NEW BUSINESS:** None.

11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS: None.

12. ITEMS FROM STAFF:

- A. Staff provided the following information regarding upcoming projects submitted to the Current Historic Preservation Planning Division to be heard during upcoming HPC meetings:
 - Mills Act Contract November 2019
 - Certificate of Appropriateness November 2019
 - French Market Project November 2019
 - Annual CLG Report November 2019

13. PUBLIC COMMENT:

VICTOR OMELCZENKO WEST HOLLYWOOD/WHPA thanked the Commission for their deliberations to the proposed items and spoke about the City's Annual 2019 Halloween Event.

14. ITEMS FROM COMMISSIONERS:

COMMISSIONER LEVIN welcomed Commissioner Gallo to the HPC.

COMMISSIONER DUBIN thanked the members for the public for their attendance, thanked Staff for their presentations and asked about a previous discussion item request that Certificate of Appropriateness projects be brought before the HPC.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN asked about the process of reporting alterations to potential historic resources and welcomed newly appointed Commissioner Gallo to the HPC.

HPC LIAISON DOUG VU said the Commission and/or members of the public should contact the City's Code Compliance department or Planning Staff.

CHAIR LAJOIE thanked members of the public for their attendance and welcomed Commissioner Gallo to the HPC.

15. ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 9:31pm to the regular scheduled meeting on *Monday*, *November 25, 2019 at 7:00 p.m., Plummer Park Community Center, Rooms 5 & 6, 7377 Santa Monica Blvd., West Hollywood, California, 90046.0*

APPROVED BY A MOTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON THIS 25th DAY OF NOVEMBER 2019.

CHAIR JACOB LAJOIE

ATTEST:

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION SECRETARY SHARITA HOUSTON

NOTE: A copy of the audio recording of this meeting can be obtained from the City Clerk's office upon request. (Disclaimer: Staff records the meetings for the sole purpose of composing the official meeting minutes; therefore, the recordings are not of commercial quality.)