

HMA

COMMUNITY STRATEGIES

Aging in Place/Aging in Community Year Two Evaluation Report

PREPARED FOR
THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD

BY
JOHN O'CONNOR
CHARLES ROBBINS, MBA
KARA RIEHMAN, PHD
JAIME GILLILAND, MA
RATHI RAMASAMY, MPH

DATE
NOVEMBER 6, 2018

515 SOUTH FLOWER STREET, SUITE 1150, LOS ANGELES, CA 90071
TELEPHONE: 213.314.9090
WWW.HEALTHMANAGEMENT.COM

➤ Table of Contents

➤ EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	1
➤ BACKGROUND.....	3
Year 1 Evaluation Highlights.....	3
➤ AIP STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES FOR YEAR 2.....	4
Introduction Narrative	4
Activities for Year 2	5
Arts Division	5
Facilities and Recreation Services.....	6
Rent Stabilization and Housing.....	6
Planning and Development Services	7
Social Services.....	8
Transit	9
➤ EVALUATION QUESTIONS IN YEAR 2	10
➤ DATA SOURCES AND METHODS FOR YEAR 2	10
Surveys	11
Interviews and Focus Groups	11
Content Analysis: Key Meetings.....	11
Documentation of Program Activities and Changes	11
Review of Outreach Activities and Department Level Activities and Accomplishments	12
➤ YEAR 2 EVALUATION ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	12
Question 1. Implementation	12
Documented City Activities	12
Question 2. Changes in Awareness of AIP.....	12
Survey Analysis and Reporting.....	12
Documented City Activities	15
Question 3. Change in Incorporation of AIP Concepts.....	16
Survey Analysis and Reporting.....	16
Content Analysis of Key Meetings	19
Question 4. Changes to Programs and Services.....	19
Survey Analysis and Reporting.....	19
Documented City Activities	22
Documentation of Program Activities and Changes.....	23
Question 5. Development of Shared Measurement for Evaluation.....	23
Question 6. Sustainability.....	23
➤ SUMMARY OF FINDINGS.....	23
➤ RECOMMENDATIONS	24
➤ NEXT STEPS	25

➤ EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In July 2016, the City of West Hollywood launched its five-year “Aging in Place, Aging in Community” Strategic Plan (AIP) to make the City a more age-friendly community, with a focus on providing support, services and interventions for older adults to maintain independence in their homes and thrive in the community. Given its dedication to monitoring the progress of AIP, the City of West Hollywood contracted an outside evaluation team from Health Management Associates Community Strategies to develop and implement a system of evaluation. In June of 2018, the City completed its second year of implementation of the five-year AIP Strategic Plan. This interim year evaluation report is a compilation of data and objective analysis to provide indicators on the areas where AIP is making progress, as well as where challenges must be overcome.

The work of the evaluation team was more extensive in the first year as AIP was in a formative stage and the evaluation was taking shape around emerging program operations. In the second and other interim years, the scope of evaluation is designed to be more focused. In the second year, the data sources that were collected and analyzed included: an annual survey (in English and Russian) completed by older adult community members; an annual survey of City staff and City Advisory Board members and Commissioners; documentation of official City meetings for which content analysis was conducted; progress reports of City-funded social service providers; interviews with key program staff and department directors to document program activities and changes.

Prior to the first year of the AIP Strategic Plan, the City issued a multi-year RFP for the provision of social services. Because that funding cycle was a three-year term, there was no new RFP response data set to evaluate in the second year.

The second year of AIP saw important organizational changes. Following the retirement of the AIP’s lead staff member, the work of implementation and evaluation of the AIP Strategic Plan was moved to a newly-created City division, the Strategic Initiatives Division, designed to address some of the City’s priorities and housed in the Human Services and Rent Stabilization Department. The City prioritized this effort and provided a structure for ongoing support of the AIP initiative.

During this time of transition, AIP-related activities, services and programs continued, thanks to the commitment of the City, its social services providers and other collaborative and partner agencies.

City program efforts continued and expanded within the City’s Arts Division, Facilities and Recreation Services Department, Housing and Rent Stabilization Division, Planning and Development Services Department, and Social Services Division, which includes transit services.

The City's contracted social service agencies, under the second year of their three-year funding cycle, also continued to provide an extensive range of programs for, or inclusive of, older adults.

Key survey indicators reflect a growth in awareness by older adults of the programs and services available and how to find them, with flat or modest positive increases in knowledge and awareness across most indicators. Results also showed older adults reported use of public spaces to have increased considerably after having decreased the year before. There was, however, a nearly 10% decrease in the number of older adults who perceive the City as safe and over a 12% decrease in those that rate the overall quality of life as good or excellent. Indicators suggest a drop in momentum in the second year of the initiative, while still reflecting a mix of positive movement. Older adults, Advisory Board members and Commissioners, and City staff all noted increases in the following areas: ability of older adults to live in housing that is affordable and safe; as well as on indicators of respect, inclusion, and connectedness in the community. In contrast, decreases in knowledge and awareness of age-friendly concepts and their application to City work were measured amongst Advisory Board members and Commissioners. A smaller decrease across the same subject matter is noted in responses from City staff, with a few large decreases, such as in the inclusion of AIP in staff goals and performance indicators, and in vendor contracting. The City's new Strategic Initiatives Division is actively supporting programming and carefully assessing strategies that support AIP to better achieve goals delineated in the strategic plan.

This report provides more extensive details on all these topics and more, following the completion of the second year of AIP.

➤ BACKGROUND

In 2013, the City of West Hollywood completed its Community Study, which included a demographic analysis and an extensive public outreach and engagement campaign. The findings of the Community Study clearly articulated a desire among residents to age in place in West Hollywood. Subsequently, the City embarked on creating a strategic plan to develop innovative approaches to support residents in maintaining independence as they age. The Aging in Place, Aging in Community 5-Year Strategic Plan (AIP) was approved by the City Council in April 2016.

The vision for AIP is to support individuals as they choose to live at home, within a community they know, where safety and independence are givens, regardless of age, income, or ability level. This approach offers many benefits to adults as they live longer lives, including a stable sense of community life, satisfaction, health, and self-esteem, all of which are central to successful aging. A goal of AIP is to drive an integrated approach to making West Hollywood a more age-friendly community by building on existing policies and programs.

Health Management Associates Community Strategies (HMACS) is serving as the evaluation consultant team for AIP and has been providing implementation and evaluation support since April 2015. HMACS produced the Year 1 Evaluation Report and presented it to the City Council in October 2017. The evaluation utilized a mixed-method approach to answer seven key evaluation questions. The tools included surveys, focus groups, and key stakeholder interviews. The detailed report can be found at <https://wehoaging.org/about-us/>. We have also included a few highlights below to establish the context of the starting point for Year 2 of AIP.

YEAR 1 EVALUATION HIGHLIGHTS

Outreach efforts to educate and inform stakeholders about the new Aging In Place Strategic Plan occurred at 56 events, reaching over 1,700 people. The outreach efforts ranged from presentations at scheduled meetings and conferences to hosting outreach activities at the annual Senior Fair.

- + In April 2016, West Hollywood was acknowledged by the AARP as “an age-friendly city.”
- + A key strategy for the sustainability of the AIP initiative included engagement of the philanthropic sector. Six grant applications were developed and two resulted in awards. One award was for \$50,000 to launch the *Be Well WeHo* program and one award of \$5,000 was received to support innovation components of AIP.
- + Based on survey data, awareness of AIP in Year 1 was high and growing. Older adults who reported knowing the concept “age-friendly” increased 6.7%, City staff awareness increased 4.5%, and awareness increased the most among Advisory Board members and Commissioners at 13.8%.
- + Discussion of older adults and AIP in key City meetings increased by 15% over the previous year (the year before the AIP plan began).

- + Of City staff surveyed, there was a 16.4% increase in agreement or strong agreement with the statement, “I know how my work can contribute to making West Hollywood more age-friendly.” There was a 34.8% increase in agreement or strong agreement with the statement, “I have changed how I do my work in order to incorporate age-friendly concepts into the work.”
- + Of West Hollywood Advisory Board members and Commissioners surveyed, 100% agreed or strongly agreed with the statement, “I believe it is possible to change a city to make it more age-friendly,” and there was a 43.1% increase in agreement or strong agreement with the statement, “When I am thinking about existing projects, I think about how to make them more age-friendly.”
- + Based on survey data, a strong majority of older adults (85.4%) agreed or strongly agreed that, “West Hollywood’s public buildings and public spaces are consistently very accessible.”

This report provides information from Year 2, which covers July 1, 2017 – June 30, 2018, of the AIP initiative’s implementation and evaluation, and provides information about the plans for ongoing evaluation.

➤ YEAR 2 AIP STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES

Introduction Narrative

During Year 2, the activities and programs in the AIP Strategic Plan continued to advance. At the end of Year 2, the City created the Strategic Initiatives Division, housed within the City’s Human Services and Rent Stabilization Department, to work on some of the City’s priority issues, including AIP, the City’s Homeless Initiative, a poverty reduction initiative and its role as a co-convenor and funder of the Los Angeles County Lesbian and Bisexual Women’s Health Collaborative. This new division is responsible for the coordination of the various components to advance the AIP Strategic Plan, as well as many of the administrative aspects of the Initiative, such as the coordination of the evaluation efforts with HMAACS.

In Year 2, the evaluation team continued to collect and analyze data to assess implementation and the ongoing impact of AIP across several categories: quality of life, social connectedness, mental health, access to resources, and other outcomes. The evaluation of Year 2 is more focused in its scope than the first year. After Year 1, it has been and remains West Hollywood’s intent to conduct a more limited scale of evaluation reporting in the interim years, while maintaining the integrity of a community-based participatory research project over the course of a five-year evaluation. On-going program evaluation will continue to be conducted based on the core set of data sources and metrics described in this report. A comprehensive final evaluation report is expected at the end of the five-year timeline.

Year 2 evaluation activities included: 1) surveying older adults, City staff, and members of the West Hollywood Advisory Boards and Commissions; 2) collecting and analyzing content analysis of key meetings; 3) documenting program activities and changes; 4) reviewing outreach activities and department level activities and accomplishments; and 5) collecting and analyzing reports of city contracted social service agencies.

Activities for Year 2

During Year 2, activity and program implementation continued. The highlights of those activities and programs are outlined below according to City division or department.

ARTS DIVISION

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + Hosted *Winter Sounds*, an afternoon concert series with 425 people in attendance. More than 75% of attendees were older adults. This was attributed to the promotional efforts focused on older adults and the sufficient timeline for promotion.
- + Hosted *Summer Sounds*, an afternoon concert series, with 200 people in attendance for the June concert. More than 60% of attendees were older adults.
- + Hosted the City's Human Rights Speaker Series with 480 people in attendance. More than 60% of attendees were older adults.
- + The City of West Hollywood's Arts and Cultural Affairs Commission approved a policy recommendation for the West Hollywood *Artists in Residence* program to establish a feasibility study looking to embed artists in social service organizations primarily serving older adults.
- + Piloted the *Senior Studio* classes for older adults to work with local artists. This was a six-week series with three people per class in attendance. The feedback from the participants was positive and the program will continue and will focus more on marketing.
- + The Arts Division staff held a meeting with the Social Services staff and Jewish Family Services to determine if there were any gaps in artmaking opportunities for community members including older adults. A gap that was identified was a need to bring art experiences to where people live. Going forward, the Arts Division will focus on providing art experiences at one or more of the housing corporation locations.
- + As part of the City's One City One Pride LGBTQ Arts Festival, the Arts Division funded *New Stages*, a project which creates a musical theatre piece incorporating stories and performances from older LGBTQ adults. The theatre piece is created via a multi-week workshop process in partnership with the Senior Services program at The Los Angeles LGBT Center. This program has been funded by the Arts Division for the past 5 years. <https://vimeo.com/281156612>
- + Also as part of the City's One City One Pride LGBTQ Arts Festival, the Division hosted a panel discussion with several of the remaining living people who were involved in the creation of the first ever rainbow flags (in San Francisco in 1978).

- + The Trans Elder Project, funded through a Transgender Arts Initiative Grant and created by the Los Angeles LGBT Center, is a 45 minute video documenting the profoundly moving stories of six transgender old adults. <https://youtu.be/DcV2MDXIVEM>
- + Three of the five artists whose work was featured in exhibits at the West Hollywood Library are older adults, including one who is aged 79 and one who is aged 84.
- + As part of the City's *WeHo Reads*, the Division hosted author events featuring at least 5 older adults.
- + The Division hosted an exhibition at Long Hall in Plummer Park entitled "*Round Hole – Square Peg*" and the exhibit was curated by an older adult.

FACILITIES AND RECREATION SERVICES DEPARTMENT

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + In November 2017, the Werle Building, located at 626 N. Robertson Boulevard, was re-opened. The newly renovated building is home to the West Hollywood Recovery Center, The ONE Archives Gallery & Museum, and the June L. Mazer Lesbian Archives. The Werle Building is a 7,533-square-foot, two-story office building built in 1940. The renovations ensured compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) in construction and fixtures. Additionally, based on community feedback, the conference room chairs that were selected have arms to assist older adults, and those who may have some physical challenges, to more easily and safely get in and out of the chairs.
- + *Be Well WeHo*, launched in Year 1, continues to offer workshops that address physical, mental, and emotional wellness for people of all ages, with a focus on older adults. The *Be Well WeHo* classes offered to older residents in Year 2 included: Aquatic Exercise, Healthier Living, Matter of Balance, and Gratitude classes. Additionally, a new working group for the *Be Well WeHo* Initiative began meeting. The working group consists of staff from various City departments and representatives from non-profit organizations that serve West Hollywood, as well as representatives from the City's Disabilities Advisory Board, Russian Advisory Board and Senior Advisory Board.

RENT STABILIZATION AND HOUSING DIVISION

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + Completed the lease-up of 33 new low-income and moderate-income inclusionary units at Domain, and eight new very low-income and low-income inclusionary units at the Crown.
- + Revived a request for proposals to conduct a study of unit transfer requests. Unit transfers are included in the Federal Fair Housing Act and allow tenants, who live on upper floors and who can no longer easily access their units, to request reasonable accommodations from their landlords to move to lower floor units. Although the

request is available, community members are not often aware of unit transfer requests. The study would identify ways the City could best support tenants to make these requests and move to lower units.

- + Worked with older adults and provided referrals to Bet Tzedek Legal Services, Coalition for Economic Survival (CES) Tenants Rights Clinic, Eviction Defense Network, and Small Claims Court Advisors to link older adults with legal counsel and defense to prevent evictions.
- + Actively monitored Section 8 tenancies with the County of Los Angeles Housing Authority, the JFS Comprehensive Services Center, and Bet Tzedek Legal Services so Section 8 tenants remained in their homes. Communicated with landlords that Section 8 rent increases are limited to Rent Stabilization Ordinance annual general adjustment and Section 8 contracts could not be canceled unless the tenant leaves or is evicted for just cause. Section 8 tenants received help filing requests for reasonable accommodations with the County Housing Authority when their finances could no longer cover rent.
- + Continued the Home Secure program offering free safety and security devices and exterior access ramps to low-income senior and disabled residents. This program expanded last year from one social service provider to three service providers.
- + Through an administrative contract with The West Hollywood Community Housing Corporation, offered “Life-long” workshops and presentations for older adults including: Accessing Senior Services, Yoga, Understanding Heat Exhaustion, Matter of Balance classes, Advance Directives, UCLA Memory Fitness, Arthritis Exercise, Nutrition Bingo, Aging with Vision Loss, hoarding presentations, and monthly birthday celebrations.

Efforts to protect older adults and help them cope with fears of housing problems are at the center of City efforts.

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + The East Side Community Priority Plan was adopted in October 2017 by City Council. The plan had been under review in Year 1 and included numerous specific references to Aging in Place as part of the planning document.
- + The Pedestrian and Bicycle Mobility Plan was adopted in September 2017 by City Council. The plan had been under review in Year 1 and included numerous specific references to AIP as part of the planning document. The current focus is working with the Department of Public Works to implement the high-priority projects identified in the plan.
- + The Public Benefits Framework was adopted in January 2017 by City Council. When a developer proposes a project that requests zoning changes to height or density, the framework (1) provides a way to give economic value for those changes and (2) gives

the developer a defined “menu” of desirable community benefits to choose. Community benefits, such as providing more affordable housing units, could benefit older adults on fixed and limited incomes.

- + Pedestrian activated, push-button traffic signals were installed at five un-controlled crosswalks at busy locations along Santa Monica Boulevard (Palm Avenue, Hancock Avenue, Westmount Drive, West Knoll Drive, and between Orange Grove Avenue and Ogden Drive). These pedestrian signals work similarly to traditional traffic signals where vehicles are controlled by traffic lights; the new signals enhance visibility and offer additional protection to pedestrians, especially to those who are older and/or have mobility challenges.
- + The Planning Department launched the “parklets” project. A parklet is a small urban park, often created by replacing a parking spot with sod, planters, trees, benches, artwork, café tables, and chairs. Parklets contribute to the vibrancy of neighborhoods, provide much needed gathering space, and offer older adults seating to rest in public areas. The Department is updating the Design District Streetscape Master Plan vision for Robertson Boulevard north of Melrose. In addition, Planning is working with the Department of Public Works to finalize the design and begin construction of the Melrose Avenue and Beverly Boulevard improvements in the Plan. Considerations for Aging In Place have been incorporated into the project.

SOCIAL SERVICES DIVISION

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + Formed an Ad-Hoc Subcommittee of the Senior Advisory Board to discuss “Seniors in Action,” a social-emotional/educational group for seniors to enhance and strengthen community connections.
- + In partnership with Los Angeles County Supervisor Sheila Kuehl’s office, Jewish Family Service and Alzheimer’s Greater Los Angeles, coordinated and presented “Matters of the Mind,” a community forum on understanding and responding to Alzheimer’s and other related dementias.
- + West Hollywood Library and City staff identified an emerging senior homeless population congregating at the West Hollywood Library. Staff reached out to Jewish Family Services and they agreed to join the roster of social services providers conducting on site-outreach and linkage to services at the Library. Providers from various agencies are on site Monday through Friday.
- + Worked with APLA Health to implement a new program to provide educational workshops for older adults living with HIV, many of whom are long-term survivors.
- + Hosted a two-day seminar entitled “Elevate: Next Level Care Aging and HIV+” a free seminar addressing concerns of those who are HIV-positive and over 50.

- + Hosted Senior Month in May which included: Seniors in Action: Community +Connection +Conversation; Senior Health Fair; Senior Advisory Committee Board Meeting and Reception; The Immortal Regiment March; Victory in Europe Day; Maysky Classical Music Gala; the 17th Annual Russian Arts and Cultural Festival; and lectures on “The Impact of Yiddish Theatre on American Theatre” and “Opera Talk: Rigoletto.”
- + Social services staff launched a new Planning and Coordination collaborative comprised of contracted agencies that provided programs and services to long-term survivors with HIV.

TRANSIT

As reported by City staff and documented in interviews, the following was accomplished in Year 2:

- + In October 2017, the Local Transit and Paratransit Services Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued. Changes in the document from the previous 2008 RFP included specific language and information about the AIP Initiative, such as the following: “The community is home to significant numbers of seniors, members of the LGBTQ community and emigres from the former Soviet Union. West Hollywood has a high proportion of residents who are transit dependent, and the City has a strong commitment to social services and programs which support “Aging in Place.” <https://wehoaging.org/about-us/>. Many people who use the CityLine fixed route service have some difficulty using the larger public transit system.” The proposals were submitted in January 2018.
- + Provided numerous in-person presentations to older adults at senior housing facilities about transportation options available in the City.
- + Provided a Metro “Older Adult Transportation” pop-up in May with information about the AIP initiative, including transportation services geared to the older adult audience. There was also a live broadcast of this event on WeHo TV.
- + In Fiscal Year 2018, there were 62,996 CityLine passengers served.
- + Dial-A-Ride provides free, curb-to-curb rides for resident older adults and those living with disabilities. In Fiscal Year 2018, there were 13,268 passengers served.
- + TLC is a free, enhanced, door-to-door transportation service which provides an assistant to help passengers to and from the vehicle on both ends of the drive; this service is utilized by the City’s most frail community members. In Fiscal Year 2018, there were 3,795 passengers served.
- + The Taxi Assistance program allows resident older adults and those with disabilities to purchase taxi fare at a substantially reduced rate. In Fiscal Year 2018, there were 18,557 passengers served.

➤ EVALUATION QUESTIONS IN YEAR 2

In Year 2, the primary evaluation questions included:

1. **Implementation:** What does the continued roll out of the Aging In Place Strategic Plan look like? In the first year, the evaluation focused on the degree to which the implementation was rolled out as planned. In the second year, the evaluation focus is on the elements that have been added or delayed.
2. **Changes in Awareness of AIP:** To what degree are older adults, other residents, and community leaders aware of the Initiative, its agenda, and its concepts and goals, and is awareness growing or stalled? HMAACS utilized the same survey tools as the first year to assess year-to-year changes in awareness.
3. **Changes in Incorporation of AIP Concepts:** To what degree do City staff and members of West Hollywood Advisory Boards and Commissions begin to incorporate age-friendly concepts into their work, as part of the “lens” through which they conduct their work? As in the first year, the Year 2 evaluation – through surveys and interviews conducted by HMAACS with City staff - focused on whether City staff reported efforts to incorporate AIP concepts into their work at the City.
4. **Changes to Programs and Services:** What changes to programs and services occur in the City and to what degree can these changes be attributed to the work of the Initiative? This includes an examination of older adults’ engagement in and satisfaction with activities and services, as well as their perceived quality of life. The Year 2 focus continues to assess whether programs and services were sensitive and responsive to the needs of older adults.
5. **Development of Shared Measurement for Future Year Evaluation:** Did the AIP Initiative take steps in its second year to incorporate more data collection methods that will allow for evaluation in upcoming years regarding the use of programs by older adults, satisfaction with these services, and additional needs? In the second year, the evaluation assessed whether the City made any progress toward a shared system.
6. **Work Toward Sustainability:** Will the implementation activities of Year 2 support the implementation of Years 3-5 of the initiative in ways that contribute to meeting future goals? **Short Term Outcomes for Older Adults:** To what degree do older adults experience changes/improvements in access to services and resources; participate and engage more in the community; and have improved quality of life? In the second year, the evaluation focused on surveys of older adults to assess participation, engagement, and perceived quality of life.

➤ DATA SOURCES AND METHODS FOR YEAR 2

In Year 2, like in Year 1, the evaluation used multiple methods to explore the questions above, including surveys, interviews, review of program documentation, and content analysis of key meetings.

SURVEYS

In 2018, HMA developed and the City disseminated the following three surveys: a survey of older adults administered at the annual Senior Health Fair and in the community; a survey of City staff; a survey of members of West Hollywood Advisory Boards and Commissions. All three were administered between May and June 2018.

Survey Responses			
	Older adults	City staff	Members of Boards and Commissions
2016	159	106	35
2017	264	54	22
2018	171	56	31

INTERVIEWS AND FOCUS GROUPS

Interviews and focus groups with older adults and key stakeholders did not take place in Year 2 of the evaluation; these methods were not intended to be annual components of the evaluation process.

CONTENT ANALYSIS: KEY MEETINGS

Systematic examination of existing documentation from key City meetings is another method used to measure the level of awareness of the AIP initiative and the degree to which AIP concepts are being incorporated into the City's way of doing business. Content analysis is a research method that is unobtrusive; it does not require individuals to fill out a survey or participate in an interview. It allows for a systematic and rigorous analysis of historical documents that can shed light on a social phenomenon. To achieve this, the minutes from 13 City Council, West Hollywood Advisory Board and Commission meetings from fiscal year 2010-2011 to fiscal year 2017-2018 were analyzed. A search function was used to locate and count any of the following words or phrases: aging, senior, older adult, Aging in Place, Aging in Community, age friendly, frail, Alzheimer's, caregiving, or caregiver. This allowed HMA to explore the degree to which these meetings reflected attention to the needs of older adults, to AIP concepts, and program changes that will support the City in becoming even more age-friendly.

DOCUMENTATION OF PROGRAM ACTIVITIES AND CHANGES

City-run efforts were tracked through interviews conducted with key division and program leaders.

In Year 1, no shared data system was in place, so a systematic analysis of changes in all the programs was not possible. However, in Year 1 progress reports from City funded social service agencies were collected and analyzed. These data sets include some standardized data about the number of older adults who participated in programs and services, their satisfaction with programs and services, the perceived value and importance of those services and programs, and perceived quality of life. Because standardized data from other programs and services was

not available, the evaluators collected qualitative information about new programs that emerged in response to the AIP initiative, and from those existing programs that showed changes in the level of attention paid to the need of older adults.

REVIEW OF OUTREACH ACTIVITIES AND DEPARTMENT LEVEL ACTIVITIES AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

City department and division activities and accomplishments were tracked by the evaluation through interviews conducted with key division and program leaders.

➤ YEAR 2 EVALUATION ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

The following findings are a result of analyzing data sources including surveys, interviews and content of key meetings.

Question 1. Implementation

DOCUMENTED CITY ACTIVITIES

Based on staff interviews, many activities from Year 1 continued to occur in Year 2. New activities, many of which were identified in the implementation plan, were also launched in Year 2. For example, the Art's Division piloted the *Senior Studio* which provided classes for older adults to work with local artists; the Planning and Development Services Department launched the "parklets" project; the Social Services Division provided support for an ad-hoc subcommittee of the Senior Advisory Board and implemented a new quarterly Planning and Coordination meeting among service providers working with long term survivors of HIV; and a 2017 RFP for transit services was released with specific language citing the Aging In Place Initiative. Extensive detail is outlined in the *Activities for Year Two* section beginning on page five of this report.

Question 2. Changes in Awareness of AIP

SURVEY ANALYSIS AND REPORTING

The survey of older adults shows a continued increase in awareness of the concepts of "age-friendliness" among survey respondents in the second year of the initiative. The percentage of respondents who answered "agree" or "strongly agree" to the two items measuring awareness of the concept increased between 2016 and 2017 by 6.7%, and again from 2017 to 2018 by an additional 8.3%.

In 2016-2017, City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members demonstrated a substantial increase in agreement with proliferation of age-friendly concepts. In 2017-2018, there was a decline of one to six percent of those who agreed they understood how the concept of "age friendliness" applies to a city, and who know what it means for a city to be age friendly. While staff and Advisory Board and Commission members reported an increase in the extent to which concept of age friendly applied to their work and regularly discussed AIP terms during meetings between 2016 and 2017, there was a substantial decrease in the percent who agreed with these items between 2017 and 2018, in some cases reflecting initial 2016 baseline levels.

The charts on the subsequent pages use the following algebraic formula to obtain the percentage of change from one year to another: the year of comparison number is divided by the previous year's number, that total is reduced by "1", and that total is multiplied by 100. (For example, 78.1 (2017) divided by 73.2 (2016) = 1.06 - 1 = .0669 x 100 = 6.699 = 6.7%)

Percent Change Formula

$$\frac{\text{New Value} - \text{Old Value}}{\text{Old Value}} \times 100$$

DRAFT

Question	Older Adults 2016	Older Adults 2017	Older Adults 2018	Change 16-17	Change 17-18
<i>Percent who agree or strongly agree</i>					
I know what it means for a city to be "age-friendly".	73.2%	78.1%	84.6%	+6.7%	+8.3%
I feel that West Hollywood is an "age-friendly" city.	75.2%	79.4%	83.4%	+5.6%	+5.0%

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
<i>Percent who agree or strongly agree</i>										
I understand the concept of "age-friendly" as it applies to a city.	91.3%	88.6%	89.1%	-3.0%	+0.6%	87.9%	100.0%	93.3%	+13.8%	-6.7%
I know what it means for a city to be "age-friendly."	88.3%	92.3%	90.7%	+4.5%	-1.7%	88.2%	100.0%	93.3%	+13.4%	-6.7%
Concepts related to age-friendliness come up regularly in conversations among city staff/boards and commissions members.	47.1%	50.0%	47.3%	+6.2%	-5.4%	51.4%	66.7%	48.4%	+29.8%	-27.4%
Concepts related to age-friendliness come up regularly in meetings.	40.6%	46.4%	39.3%	+14.3%	-15.3%	54.3%	65.0%	45.2%	+19.7%	-30.5%

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
Concepts related to age-friendliness are a regular part of meeting agendas and planning processes.	26.5%	38.1%	28.6%	+43.8%	-24.9%	42.9%	52.4%	43.3%	+22.1%	-17.4%
I talk with my team about the importance of incorporating age-friendly concepts into our work.	38.8%	49.4%	38.2%	+27.3%	-22.7%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

DOCUMENTED CITY ACTIVITIES

Awareness of the AIP initiative continues to build. For example, the Arts Division staff held a meeting with the Human Services Commission and Jewish Family Services to see if there were any gaps in art-making opportunities for older adults. This conversation prompted the Arts Division to focus on bringing art experiences to one or more of the West Hollywood Community Housing Corporation locations. Transportation provided a pop-up activity, “Older Adult Transportation,” to provide information about the AIP initiative and how older adults may utilize transportation services, including the Metro; there were older adults present for the event, but there was also a live broadcast of the event on WeHo TV. Additionally, Social Services hosted a two-day seminar entitled “Elevate: next level care Aging and HIV+” a free seminar addressing concerns of those who are HIV-positive and over 50.

Despite the decrease in awareness of age-friendly concepts among City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members, older adults in the community maintain an understanding and appreciation of these concepts, and City activities continue.

Question 3. Change in Incorporation of AIP Concepts

SURVEY ANALYSIS AND REPORTING

While there were slight decreases in agreement that changes could be made to make a city age-friendly, and work can contribute to making the city age-friendly between 2017 and 2018, over 80% of respondents maintain agreement with these concepts in 2018. There was a slight increase in the percent of City staff who agreed they have changed how they do their work generally to incorporate age-friendly concepts from 2017 to 2018; however, there was a decline in all measures indicating specifically how they have incorporated the concept into their work, including adding goals and performance measures related to age-friendly concepts and incorporating these concepts into written contracts. While there was a slight decrease between 2017 and 2018, almost three quarters of City staff and Board/Commission members reported agreeing that West Hollywood is an age-friendly city, and more than 60% agree they have seen changes in awareness of the concept among City employees, Advisory Board and Commission members.

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
	<i>Percent who agree or strongly agree</i>									
I believe it is possible to change a city to make it more age-friendly.	90.6%	96.4%	94.6%	+6.4%	-1.9%	94.1%	100.0%	87.1%	+6.3%	-12.9%
I know that my work can contribute to making West Hollywood more age-friendly.	89.5%	86.9%	85.7%	-2.9%	-1.4%	85.7%	100.0%	80.6%	+16.7%	-19.4%
I know how my work can contribute to making West Hollywood more age-friendly.	68.3%	79.5%	76.8%	+16.4%	-3.4%	80.0%	90.9%	77.4%	+13.6%	-14.9%
I have changed how I do my work in order to incorporate age-friendly concepts into the work.	46.5%	62.7%	64.3%	+34.8%	+2.6%	57.1%	75.0%	58.1%	+31.4%	-22.5%

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
When I am undertaking a new project, I think about how to make it more age-friendly.	52.4%	61.9%	58.9%	+18.1%	-4.9%	65.7%	85.7%	71.0%	+30.4%	-17.2%
When I am thinking about existing projects, I think about how to make them more age-friendly.	50.0%	55.4%	54.5%	+10.8%	-1.6%	62.9%	90.0%	80.6%	+43.1%	-10.4%
I have specific goals for my work around age-friendliness.	40.4%	45.2%	41.1%	+11.9%	-9.1%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
I have incorporated age-friendly concepts into my staff's goals and key performance indicators. (Check "not applicable" if you do not supervise staff.)	30.5%	21.7%	17.9%	-28.9%	-17.5%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
My supervisor has incorporated age-friendly concepts into my goals and key performance indicators.	31.7%	42.9%	28.6%	+35.3%	-33.3%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
I have changed how I write contracts with vendors to require that they do things in a more age-friendly way.	17.1%	15.7%	8.9%	-8.2%	-43.3%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
I have added measures of age-friendliness to evaluation related to my work.	20.2%	26.2%	21.4%	+29.7%	-18.3%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Older adults know what it means for a city to be “age-friendly.”	25.0%	36.0%	31.1%	+44.0%	-13.6%	43.3%	29.4%	24.1%	-32.1%	-18.0%
Older adults feel that West Hollywood is an “age-friendly” city.	39.8%	46.7%	35.6%	+17.3%	-23.8%	48.3%	35.3%	20.0%	-26.9%	-43.3%
I feel that West Hollywood is an “age-friendly” city.	70.1%	76.3%	73.9%	+8.8%	-3.2%	69.7%	88.2%	76.7%	+26.5%	-13.0%
I have noticed changes in the awareness about age-friendly concepts within and among city employees/boards and commissions members.	52.9%	67.1%	63.0%	+26.8%	-6.1%	65.6%	75.0%	73.3%	+14.3%	-2.3%
I have noticed changes in the awareness about age-friendly concepts among residents (not among city employees).	59.3%	42.3%	31.8%	-28.7%	-24.8%	72.7%	50.0%	40.0%	-31.2%	-20.0%

CONTENT ANALYSIS OF KEY MEETINGS

Similar to survey findings, analysis of staff reports from City Council meetings shows that discussion of AIP-related concerns, as measured by analyzing terminology associated with aging and seniors, increased from 2014/15 to 2016/17, but decreased significantly in 2017/18. In 2016/17, relevant terms were mentioned 412 times, but in 2017/18 terms were mentioned only 48 times. Meeting minutes from other Commission meetings indicates much less discussion of aging-related terms generally and did not change appreciably over the past three years.

Question 4. Changes to Programs and Services

SURVEY ANALYSIS AND REPORTING

Survey results among adults, City staff, and Advisory Board and Commission members were mixed for perceptions of availability of programs and services for older adults. Among older adults surveyed there was a substantial increase between 2017 and 2018 in the percent who reported knowing how to find health and social services information, using West Hollywood's open spaces, obtaining information about social and community activities if needed, and knowing how to find home health and personal care services. Overall, the vast majority of older adults surveyed (from 70-87%), feel services in West Hollywood are accessible to them. Similar to the results for older adults, there was an increase in the percent of City staff and Advisory Board/Commission members who feel the City's open spaces are age friendly. Responses between City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members differed in terms of their perception of specific services available to older adults; however, for most items, the percent of respondents agreeing services are available decreased for all with the exception of availability of safe and affordable housing. The percent of both City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members who feel older adults are respected and included in the community increased from 2017 to 2018 by 6% and 42%, respectively.

While City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members perceived a decrease in some services, older adults actually report increases in access, particularly around availability of information needed to access specific services.

Question	Older Adults 2016	Older Adults 2017	Older Adults 2018	Change 16-17	Change 17-18
<i>Percent who agree or strongly agree</i>					
I use West Hollywood's open spaces regularly.	78.3%	71.5%	79.0%	-8.7%	+10.5%
West Hollywood's public buildings and public spaces are consistently very accessible.	85.4%	85.3%	82.8%	-0.1%	-2.9%
West Hollywood's public transportation system is consistently very accessible and very easy to use.	77.0%	78.6%	75.9%	+2.1%	-3.4%
West Hollywood's public transportation system always has stops where I need them.	68.2%	69.0%	67.5%	+1.2%	-2.2%
I am able to afford and have easy access to healthy food.	69.1%	72.7%	70.6%	+5.2%	-2.9%
If I have a need for health or social services or information, I know how to easily find what I need.	76.2%	77.5%	85.8%	+1.7%	+10.7%
If I want to participate in social and community activities, I know how to easily find information about activities I am interested in.	74.8%	76.7%	82.9%	+2.5%	+8.1%
I have a primary care doctor, or a regular source of health care services when I need them.	83.9%	87.6%	87.2%	+4.4%	-0.5%
If I need home health services to help me recover from an illness, or personal care to help with chores that are too much for me lately, I know how to get them.	55.8%	64.0%	72.7%	+14.7%	+13.6%

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
<i>Percent who agree or strongly agree</i>										
West Hollywood's open spaces are age friendly.	67.4%	73.4%	76.1%	+8.9%	+3.7%	65.6%	64.7%	76.7%	-1.4%	+18.6%
West Hollywood's public buildings and public spaces are consistently very accessible.	68.6%	82.3%	80.4%	+20.0%	-2.3%	75.0%	70.6%	73.3%	-5.9%	+3.8%
West Hollywood's public transportation system is consistently very accessible and very easy to use.	70.5%	86.3%	69.6%	+22.4%	-19.4%	67.7%	70.6%	66.7%	+4.28%	-5.5%
West Hollywood's public transportation system always has stops where I need them.	50.0%	66.7%	53.3%	+33.4%	-20.1%	35.5%	58.8%	40.0%	+65.6%	-32.0%
Older adults feel very respected and included in the community in West Hollywood.	59.3%	67.1%	71.1%	+13.2%	+6.0%	51.6%	35.3%	50.0%	-31.6%	+41.6%
Older adults are able to live in housing that is affordable and safe.	30.6%	33.3%	35.6%	+8.8%	+6.9%	40.6%	17.6%	26.7%	-56.7%	+51.7%
Older adults feel very connected to their neighbors.	32.5%	40.3%	42.2%	+24.0%	+4.7%	31.3%	29.4%	16.7%	-6.1%	-43.2%
Older adults are able to afford and have easy access to healthy food.	29.8%	35.5%	31.1%	+19.1%	-12.4%	21.9%	41.2%	20.0%	+88.1%	-51.5%
If older adults have a need for health or social services or information, they know how to easily find what they need.	42.9%	47.4%	46.7%	+10.5%	-1.5%	35.5%	47.1%	30.0%	+32.7%	-36.3%

Question	City Staff Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18	Boards and Commissions Members			Change 16-17	Change 17-18
	2016	2017	2018			2016	2017	2018		
If older adults want to participate in social and community activities, they know how to easily find information about activities they are interested in.	44.7%	57.1%	55.6%	+27.7%	-2.6%	38.7%	47.1%	34.5%	+21.7%	-26.8%
Older adults have a primary care doctor, or a regular source of health care services when they need them.	21.7%	34.2%	40.0%	+57.6%	+17.0%	26.7%	29.4%	10.0%	+10.1%	-66.0%
If older adults need home health services to help them recover from an illness, or personal care to help with chores that are too much for them lately, they know how to get them.	19.3%	33.3%	26.7%	+72.5%	-19.8%	19.4%	18.8%	16.7%	-3.1%	-11.2%
I have noticed changes in services, facilities, and/or programs in the city that make it more age-friendly.	52.9%	66.7%	63.0%	+26.1%	-5.6%	65.6%	81.3%	66.7%	+23.9%	-18.0%

DOCUMENTED CITY ACTIVITIES

Amongst many examples substantiating the finding that progress was made in implementing programs and service, the Planning and Development Services Department provided the following tangible examples: the adoption of The Eastside Community Priority plan; the Pedestrian and Bicycle Mobility plan; the Public Benefits Framework. On the organizational level, the creation of the City's new Strategic Initiatives Division clearly indicates a deliberate structural change that will further the work of AIP strategies and activities.

DOCUMENTATION OF PROGRAM ACTIVITIES AND CHANGES

The evaluators also examined data on demographics of clients served by social service programs funded by the City. Programs report on number of clients served in various age groups. For the purposes of this report, we include those in the age groups of 40-59, 60-69, 70-79, and 80 and above as older adults served.

Older Adults Served, 2016		
Age	#	%
40-59	2,791	27.6
60-69	1,305	12.9
70-79	884	8.7
80+	1,029	10.2
Total clients served, ages 40-80+	6,009	59.3
Total clients served, all ages	10,125	100.0

Older Adults Served, 2017		
Age	#	%
40-59	2,385	21.8
60-69	1,138	10.4
70-79	900	8.2
80+	1,048	9.6
Total clients served, ages 40-80+	5,471	50.1
Total clients served, all ages	10,925	100.0

Question 5. Development of Shared Measurement for Evaluation

THE WORK TO DEVELOP A SHARED MEASUREMENT SYSTEM FOR THE EVALUATION IS EXPECTED TO TAKE PLACE IN YEAR 3.

Question 6. Sustainability

The City made a significant organizational commitment in creating of the Strategic Initiatives Division to ensure structure and leadership for the continued growth and sustainability of AIP within the City.

➤ SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

Year 2 of saw both new and continued activity, and some drop-off in momentum in certain areas. The survey of older adults shows a continued increase in perceptions of the City as age-friendly among older adult respondents, with over 80% agreeing that West Hollywood is an age-friendly city. And while there was a slight decrease between 2017 and 2018 in the percent of City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members who agreed the City is age-friendly, still more than 90% of respondents agreed with this assessment. In addition, the City

implemented a variety of new and continued activities to support older adults, particularly in the areas of arts and culture, facilities and recreation services, and social services.

Survey results are consistent with these enhanced activities, as evidenced by the increase in older adults who reported using the City's open spaces regularly (79%), knowing how to find information about health or social services (86%), knowing how to easily find information about social and community activities (83%), and knowing how to access home health services or personal care help (73%). And while there were slight decreases in positive perceptions of other City services, such as public transportation, access to healthy food, and accessibility of public buildings, over 67% of older adults agree these services are accessible. Similarly, increases were seen among City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members who agree that the City's open spaces are age friendly, with an increase among Advisory Board and Commission members who view public buildings as accessible. The percentage of City staff and Board and Commission members who viewed that affordable and safe housing is available also increased from 2017 to 2018, as did perceptions that older adults feel respected and included in the community.

While activities related to the AIP initiative continued and increased in some respects, perceptions among City staff and Advisory Board and Commission members in how much AIP concepts are explicitly incorporated into their routine activities and work decreased in some areas. While 2017 saw increases in how AIP was incorporated into routine work, there were decreases in 2018 among respondents that concepts related to age-friendliness come up regularly in conversations and meetings, that age-friendly initiatives are explicitly part of meeting agendas, and that the importance of incorporating age-friendly concepts into work is discussed among teams. Similarly, after increases were seen from 2016 to 2017 in specific areas of incorporating age-friendly concepts into work, there were noted decreases from 2017 to 2018 in areas such as changing how work is done to incorporate concepts, thinking about how to make new and existing projects age-friendly, incorporating age-friendly concepts into performance goals and measures, and changing how contracts are written to require more attention to age-friendly concepts.

The results are clear that activities to support older adults are continuing, and in some cases increasing, and that older adults are experiencing the benefit of these activities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

To ensure continued emphasis that the AIP Strategic Plan and its companion Implementation Plan are carried out, we recommend the following actions:

- + Conduct a review of the Implementation Plan for AIP and update activities for Year 3 and beyond based on actual progress.

- + Implement regular check-in meetings among various department directors and division managers and the Strategic Initiatives Manager to review and discuss AIP goals and objectives as outlined in the Implementation Plan.
- + Add AIP discussion time to departmental meeting agendas and/or planning process.
- + Provide a copy of the AIP strategic plan to new City Advisory Board Members, Commissioners, and staff members during orientation or their onboarding process.
- + Consider a public forum or event focused on updating the community on the status of AIP.
- + Enhance communication efforts to residents about AIP.
- + Explore the creation of a category for Aging In Place on the home page of the City's website.
- + Continue to upload the AIP evaluation reports to the AIP webpage.

➤ NEXT STEPS

In Years 3-5, the Strategic Initiatives Division will continue to build awareness of AIP and its related programs to address the needs of older adults.

Future activities include:

- + Continued tracking of activities and progress made toward the goals outlined in the implementation plan
- + Older adult surveys in May 2019, 2020, 2021
- + Surveys of City staff in May 2019, 2020, 2021
- + Surveys of members of West Hollywood Advisory Boards and Commissions in May 2019, 2020, 2021
- + Analyses of data generated from evaluation requirements in City contracts
- + Close tracking and analyses of process and outcome measures within several key programs in alignment with priorities outlined in the implementation plan
- + Analyses of community level measures in Years 3-5

These data collection methods and analyses will allow for continued and expanded evaluation of the Initiative, resulting in annual reports and a final report that will assess outcomes across the five years. To ensure sustainability of the Initiative in Years 3-5, the City has implemented several key steps.

First, the City has incorporated priorities in its Social Services Request for Proposal (RFP) that organizations specifically work to meet the needs of older adults in their programs and services. This ensures ongoing attention to the needs of older adults within these funded projects for the

next funding cycle. Additionally, it is anticipated that the 2018-2019 Community Study will identify the needs of older adults in the City and will inform the next round of social service funding in 2019. Second, the City has successfully extended additional requests to more than 20 City-funded social service agencies for their partnership to distribute older adult surveys on their experiences with the age-friendliness of West Hollywood. This effort will provide data to ensure that contracted organizations are collecting data that will inform the evaluation of the Initiative in upcoming years and, equally importantly, that organizations are collecting data that will inform their own success and challenges in meeting the needs of the West Hollywood community members they serve.

Third, the initiative has developed a detailed Implementation Plan that extends through Years 3-5. This Implementation Plan was created in collaboration and with the support of City staff, which has served to increase the awareness and buy-in of City staff for the Initiative. This investment will continue to be leveraged in upcoming years by providing staff with ongoing communication about the goals, successes, and challenges of the Initiative, and opportunities for staff to continue to engage with the Initiative by holding cross-departmental meetings and briefings about the initiative, supporting increased collaboration across program areas, and sharing evaluation findings across the City staff, Advisory Boards and Commissions, City Council and with the community.