

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES Monday, April 22, 2013 – 7:00 P.M.

1. CALL TO ORDER Vice-Chair Charles called the meeting to order at

7:00pm.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Charlie, Rice, Ostergren, Vice-Chair Charles, Castro,

Levin and Chair Torgan

Absent: None.

STAFF PRESENT: Stephanie Reich HPC Liaison, Andrew Goodrich HPC

Intern and Sharita Ellies Commission Secretary

## 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the Agenda.

**Recommendation:** Approve the agenda of Monday April 22, 2013 as presented. **Moved by Commissioner Levin, seconded by Commissioner Castro and unanimously carried.** 

## 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the minutes of prior Historic Preservation Commission meetings.

**Recommendation:** Approve the meeting minutes of, March 26, 2013 as amended. **Moved by Commissioner**, **Levin seconded by Commissioner Castro and unanimously carried**; **noting the abstention by Chair Torgan**.

## CHAIR TORGAN requested the following change:

**Pg. 1 of 12:** VICE-CHAIR CHARLES moved to continue Item 9.A - 8801 Sunset Boulevard (Tower Records) to the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission. **Motion failed unanimously noting the absence of Chair Torgan and Commissioner <del>Torgan</del> <b>^Castro.** 

## COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN requested the following changes:

**Pg. 3 of 12:** The Commission determined that the buildings at 921 **^927** and 931 Palm Avenue were eligible for designation under Criterion A: Special Elements of the City. At that time, the commission directed staff to return with a revised resolution.

**Pg.5 of 12:** aesthetic consideration. She also commented on the issue of integrity seeing that the missing feature ^ features of the building ^, paint and signage, were ephemeral.

**Pg. 9 of 12:** VICE-CHAIR CHARLES asked if the Applicant included information in his book, "Ride "^Riot on the Sunset Strip" about Tower Records.

Pg. 10 of 12: COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN spoke on Commissioner Levin's comments about integrity. she She said the structure and parking lot remain intact; \*she said because the paint and signage which are the primary character defining features were not permanent and are no longer extant, creates difficulties with the nomination and said West Hollywood does not have and \*any age limit \*towards designation.

**Pg. 12 of 12:** CATHY BLAIVAS RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD thanked the Commission regarding their professionalism with the nomination presented tonight and hoped that there will be a member of the HPC at the Great Hall/Long Hall nomination at the May 6 ^1, 2013 City Council Meeting ^Historic Resource Commission Meeting.

## VICE-CHAIR CHARLES requested the following correction:

**Pg. 11 of 12:** ACTING CHAIR CHARLES spoke with the New Urban Designer, Peter Noonan \*William Crouch.....

## COMMISSIONER CASTRO requested the following corrections:

**Pg. 4 of 12:** He said the vacant site is **^was** currently occupied by the former Tower Records **^store** and is currently leasing its adjacent parking lot as a commercial parking space.

**Pg. 7 of 12:** He said the building should be designated and the site as well due to the history and era of previous business owner Earl "Madman" Munzt. ^Muntz.

- **5. Public Comment:** None.
- **6. CONSENT CALENDAR:** None.
- 7. **EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR:** None.
- **8. COMMISSION CONSIDERATION:** None.
- 9. PUBLIC HEARINGS:
  - A. 8801 SUNSET BOULEVARD (TOWER RECORDS): continued from March 26, 2013 Special HPC Meeting. Consideration of nomination for 8801 Sunset Boulevard for designation as a local Cultural Resource.

CHAIR TORGAN and COMMISSIONER CASTRO disclosed that they listened to the audio recording of the special HPC meeting of March 26, 2013; they reviewed the agenda packet and all correspondence and are able to make a decision at tonight's meeting.

Chair Torgan disclosed that he is a former associate of Alston and Bird, LLP and is a former colleague of Mrs. Carlsen without prejudice.

CHAIR TORGAN moved to re-open Item 9.A. Public Comment which was closed during the March 2013 Special HPC Meeting, **Moved by Vice-Chair Charles seconded by Commissioner Levin and unanimously carried.** 

STAFF ANDREW GOODRICH noted for the record an error on page 5 of the Staff report: "Therefore, staff concludes that there is **^not** sufficient basis to designate the subject property as a Cultural Resource under Criterion A".

He reiterated Staff's acknowledgement of Tower Records impact in the social and cultural history of West Hollywood and Sunset Strip and said the subject property does meet the first of two conditions of the Municipal Code.

He said based on the information contained in NRB 15 and the CCR's, consultation with the City Attorney, and comparable case study research from Venice and Los Angeles, CA, staff believes that 8801 Sunset Boulevard must retain sufficient physical characteristics to be eligible under Criterion A.

Staff continues to believe that the building lacks the integrity needed to qualify for designation under Criterion A. as articulated in last month's staff report and said the property does not appear to be eligible under Criteria B, C, or D. as well.

Therefore, staff continues to recommend that the Commission adopt Resolution HPC 13-107, recommending to the City Council denial of 8801 Sunset Boulevard as a Cultural Resource.

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH clarified that Staff's research of the Venice West Café reveals that space #7 is utilized as a café therefore retains similar use and some significant measure of integrity although their ordinance does not require them to.

## Item 9.A. Commission Questions To Staff

**CHAIR TORGAN** asked if the EIR discussed in the previous meeting was certified.

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH said because the development project was denied, the EIR there was no action taken and was not certified.

## Item 9.A. Commissioner Questions to Staff Closed

## Item 9.A. Public Comments

DOMENIC PRIORE/APPLICANT RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF TUJUNGA spoke against Staff's recommendation to deny the building as

a Local Cultural Resource. He commented regarding question of the building maintaining structural integrity and stated that absent of signage, there have been no structural changes to the building.

He commented regarding the number of speakers from the previous HPC meeting and the press in support of the project being designated as a resource.

He compared the signage of Tower Records and the downtown L.A. designated "Black Cat" and asked that the Commission take in consideration the importance of structural integrity and not paint.

# Item 9.A. Commission Questions To Applicant

VICE-CHAIR CHARLES asked if the Applicant if he thought the signage was a character defining aspect of the building.

DOMENIC PRIORE said no, he didn't feel the signage was character defining but did embody what the store was. He said the knowledge of Tower Records was not defined by its previous yellow and red color. He said the building remains intact and its history defines it as well.

## Item 9.A. Public Comment

NICKI CARLSEN LAW OFFICES OF ALSTON & BIRD/OWNER REPRESENTATIVE RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to deny the building as a Local Cultural Resource.

She commented on previous comments by Mr. Priore. She said the integrity of the building, removing its original paint and signage has negatively impacted the building and has been changed by at least two different owners.

She said she read the articles regarding the press supporting designation and it appears that Mr. Priores comments may not be true and that her "actions of bad faith" allegations by Mr. Priore have no basis.

LYNDIA LOWY SECRETARY OF THE WEST HOLLYWOOD ALLIANCE/ RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to deny the building as a Local Cultural Resource.

She said the Alliance met with the applicant and had a presentation by him at their last meeting. She said the building in its present condition does not constitute cultural resource designation.

She said from a broader context, the Sunset Strip is vitally important to West Hollywood and played a key role in its history of Rock and Roll. She

recommended that Tower Records and buildings like it could constitute a historic district documenting Rock and Roll in the entertainment industry.

TODD MEEHAN RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF SUN VALLEY former 20year employee of Tower Records spoke against Staff's recommendation to deny the building as a Local Cultural Resource.

He commented regarding previous statements regarding the cultural significance building being in question and said the store itself was known by music lovers around the world.

He said although the color has changed the building remains the same. He said when Tower Records originally opened the building did not have signs and there were clear windows only. He said a plaque will be appreciated but will not take the place of the building and its history.

JEROME CLEARY RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke against Staff's recommendation to deny the building as a Local Cultural Resource.

He said reopening public comments tonight did not allow for professional representation to testify. He expressed concerns with the original application process.

He commented regarding the present deteriorating condition of the exterior of the building and said although the color has changed, the structure remains the same. He said Tower Records was one of the major destinations visited on the Sunset Strip.

He asked that the Commission take in consideration the significance of the history of the location and the site and said he supports its designation.

APPLICANT DOMENIC PRIORE also commented in support of a potential Sunset Strip Entertainment District due its prominent history of entertainers and the present state of its independent businesses on Sunset Strip.

He said the building is historically the same and maintains it structural integrity.

## Item 9.A. Public Comment Closed.

## **Item 9.A. Commissioner Comments**

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. He commented regarding the cultural significance of the site and said it is undeniably recognized as cultural historic location, the building appears to be the same and that the

challenge to designating it as a cultural resource is the removal of its character defining features of paint and signs.

He asked if there was a way to give some type of designation or commemorative display to acknowledge its history of the building.

The Commission and Staff discussed a potential commemorative plaque and/or interpretive display for Tower Records outside a formal designation as well as the process of site designations.

CHAIR TORGAN spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. He commented regarding the interim EIR study provided in the March 26<sup>th</sup> HPC meeting; he said although not certified he found it to be authoritative.

He said development permits are not within the jurisdiction of the HPC and therefore will not address that issue.

He spoke about the application not meeting the criteria of the City's ordinance and said the ordinance is oriented towards tangible items not towards the social and cultural fabric of the City.

He said Criterion A is geared towards architecture/distinctive characteristics and that the present state of the building does not maintain its ephemeral character defining features which were paint, signage, and the Tower Records logo.

He said a workaround could be requesting that City Council designate the intersection around the area as "Tower Records Square" or some type of City initiated form of recognition.

VICE-CHAIR CHARLES spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. He said the definition of integrity, as defined by the Secretary of Interior Standards has not been met with this structure.

He agreed with Chair Torgan's interpretation of the Commissions purview and the ordinance. He said there's a set criterion for designation and although he agreed that Tower Records does represent elements of cultural, economic and social history, the Commission must designate structures on a broader scale, particularly integrity as opposed to isolated definitions like those of the City of Los Angeles.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. She commented regarding the structure of the building and said although it's intact and some of the physical material remains, the ephemeral, visual character defining features are gone.

She said the main concerns regarding the designation were integrity and the building conveying its significance as Tower Records in its present state; a contemporary would not recognize it as an iconic record store. She also said the Commission is not in a position to mandate that the present owner make repairs to return the building to its former state.

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE said he disagreed that a contemporary would not recognize the building as an iconic record store. He expressed concerns regarding the potential designations of other cultural resource being affected by the question of structures maintaining integrity in the near future.

COMMISSIONER CASTRO spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. He stated information for designation under Criterion A and said although the site has a significant social and cultural history of music and contribution to Sunset Strip; it does not maintain the iconic character defining features therefore lacks integrity.

He found Staff's additional research of the NRB 15 and the CCR Title 14 which also prove a lack of integrity very compelling as well.

He said he supports the suggestion by Preservation Alliance regarding a Museum or Music District and the recommendation for a plague to memorialize the site by the City.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN spoke in favor Staff's recommendation to deny the designation as a cultural resource. He thanked the Applicant for bring the item forward and Todd Meehan for his presentation.

He agreed with previous comments regarding cultural and social significance. He disagreed with the applicant regarding the character defining features are not relevant. He said the Commission is required to follow the law regarding private owned properties and the question of integrity of the building has been challenged.

He said he supports Staff's recommendation but there should be some type of memorialization of the site.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN moved to approve Resolution No. HPC 13-107 with the following additional language provided by Chair Torgan and seconded by Commissioner Castro:

"Because of its cultural significance recommend further that the City of West Hollywood commemorate the site either by designating the intersection of Sunset Boulevard, Horn Avenue and Holloway Avenue as Tower Records Square with appropriate signage in the City right of way or other site specific commemoration such as a plaque also in City property as Council may deem appropriate".

Action: Approve amended Resolution No. HPC 13-107 to deny the designation of the structure located at 8801 Sunset Boulevard as a cultural resource, seconded by Commissioner Castro and passes on roll call vote:

Ayes: Charlie, Rice, Ostergren, Castro, Levin, Charles, and

Torgan,

Noes: None Recuse: None Absent: None

Resolution No. HPC 13-107, A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL DENY THE DESIGNATION OF THE STRUCTURE LOCATED AT 8801 SUNSET BOULEVARD, WEST HOLLYWOOD, CALIFORNIA AS A LOCAL CULTURAL RESOURCE.

Item 9.A. Closed

#### **10. NEW BUSINESS:** None.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN moved to amend the regularly scheduled meeting agenda to hear Item 14 Public Comment out of order, seconded by Commissioner Ostergren and unanimously carried.

#### ITEM 14 PUBLIC COMMENTS HEARD OUT OF ORDER

TODD MEEHAN RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD commented regarding the Commission's action towards Item 9.A. He thanked the Commission for the amendment to the resolution and suggested that it be named Tower Records Way.

He said the plaque is an excellent idea and also suggest an alternate 3-D image be considered as well.

APPLICANT DOMINIQUE PRIORE agreed that the suggested commemoration plaque was an excellent idea and also suggested other creative options.

## 11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

## A. ANNUAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION EVENT:

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH spoke about the following:

- May 2013 as preservation month.
- Meeting structure and proposed event outline

- Training Session for the Commission, the Preservation Alliance and the public.
- Potential Invitation to Beverly Hills Cultural Heritage Commission as guest
- MAC potential venue
- Event Date TBD
- Commissioner Charlie and Commissioner Ostergren appointed to assist with event planning
- Presentation/proclamation from the City Council

**Action:** Commissioner Ostergren moved to direct Staff to go forward with event planning for the Annual Historic Preservation Event with a tentative, May 30, 2013 date for the event which will bring together the Historic Preservation Commission, Preservation Alliance and the Public with presentations and conversations regarding preservation issues in the City of West Hollywood with the assistance of Commissioner Charlie and Commissioner Ostergren, **seconded by Commissioner Levin and unanimously carried.** 

## 12. ITEMS FROM STAFF:

**A.** Multifamily Incentive Program – Five Proposals Received, a Subcommittee has been planned to date.

## 13. HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE commented regarding the date of HPC Event and also asked if the West Hollywood Code could be changed to broaden the definition of Social Significance.

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH explained the process of redefining the social significance definition and said she would bring the topic to Staff and the City Attorney for further direction and possibly bring it back to the Commission June or July 2013 as a discussion Item.

CHAIR TORGAN commented regarding present socially significant buildings within West Hollywood and said he too agreed that there should be discussion regarding redefining the definition of social significance.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN commented regarding the need and importance of addressing a possible commercial survey.

COMMISSIONER RICE asked if there's a list of plaques and commemorative items within the City.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN commented regarding a cluster of buildings on the 1986/1987 Historic Resource Survey Final Report that pre-dates the Rock and Roll era and also requested a copy of the survey report.

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH said the report will possibly be added to the City's website but the cluster references architectural significance not the Rock and Roll historic era.

COMMISSIONER OSTERGREN commented regarding Commission Castro's comments regarding the Preservation Alliance.

She commented regarding commemorative recognition options and suggested that the Historic Preservation Commission and Public Arts Commission work collaboratively to identify sites and create other commemorative options.

She commented about the dates of the annual CPF Conference.

CHAIR TORGAN commented regarding the upcoming May 1, 2013 State Historic Commission meeting REGARDING Plummer Park and said Great Hall/Long Hall is on the agenda.

VICE-CHAIR CHARLES commented regarding creative ways of commemorative recognition instead of plaques and spoke about possibly mimicking Downtown Los Angeles's pictorial essays as a form of recognition.

CHAIR TORGAN commented regarding the topic, "Historic Preservation for Shrinking Cities" discussed at the 2013 APA Conference in Chicago and said a panel member acknowledged the City of West Hollywood's Multi-Family RFP and said the City is a leader in historic preservation and in affordable housing.

LIAISON STEPHANIE REICH encouraged the Commission to write proposals to the National APA Conference which will be held in Atlanta, Georgia next year and encourage them to support and or provide more Historic Preservation information during the conferences.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 9:48 pm to a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission on **Monday, June** 

APPROVED BY A MOTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON THIS 22<sup>nd</sup> DAY OF APRIL, 2013.

CHAIRPERSON

ATTEST:

HISTORIC PRESERVATION STAFF LIAISON